United Nations E/CN.5/2005/5

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
30 November 2004

Original: English

Commission for Social Development
Fortieth session
9-18 February 2005
Item 3(b) of the provisional agenda*
Follow-up to the World Summit for Social Development and the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly: review of relevant United Nations plans and programmes of action pertaining to the situation of social groups

Monitoring the implementation of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities

Note by the Secretary-General

At its forty-eighth session, the General Assembly adopted the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities, contained in the annex to its resolution 48/96 of 20 December 1993.[1] These 22 Rules provide a framework to further implement the goals of equality and full participation of disabled persons in social life and development set forth in the World Programme of Action concerning Disabled Persons, adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 37/52 of 3 December 1982.[2] In section IV, paragraph 2, of the Standard Rules, it is stipulated that the Rules shall be monitored within the framework of the sessions of the Commission for Social Development. The appointment of a Special Rapporteur to monitor their implementation within the framework of the Commission for Social Development was also envisaged in that paragraph. In March 1994, the Secretary-General appointed Bengt Lindqvist (Sweden) Special Rapporteur on disability of the Commission for Social Development. Mr. Lindqvist prepared three reports for the consideration of the Commission during his mandate,[3] which was renewed in 1997[4] and in 2000.[5] In June 2003, the Secretary-General appointed Sheikha Hessa Al-Thani (Qatar) Special Rapporteur for the period 2003-2005. The Special Rapporteur submitted an oral report to the forty-second session of the Commission for Social Development outlining her plan of work.[6] In its resolution 2004/15, the Economic and Social Council requested the Special Rapporteur to submit a report on the monitoring of the implementation of the Standard Rules to the Commission for Social Development at its forty-third session.

---

* E/CN.5/2005/1.

The Secretary-General has the honour to transmit to the Commission the report of the Special Rapporteur on monitoring the implementation of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities during the period 2003-2005.

Notes

[1] Available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/dissre00.htm.

[2] A/37/351/Add.1 and Add.1/Corr.1, sect. VIII; available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/diswpa00.htm.

[3] A/52/56, available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/dismsre0.htm; E/CN.5/2000/3, annex, available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/disecn003e0.htm, and E/CN.5/2002/4, available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/disecn520024e0.htm.

[4] Economic and Social Council resolution 1997/19, available from http://www.un.org/documents/ecosoc/res/1997/eres1997-19.htm.

[5] Economic and Social Council resolution 2000/10, available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/ecosoc2000-10.htm.

[6] Available from http://www.un.org/esa/socdev/enable/sresocd42.htm.

Report of the Special Rapporteur on Disability of the Commission for Social Development

Contents

		Paragraphs	Page
I.	Introduction	1–15	4
	A. Guiding principles	4–10	4
	B. Setting priorities	11–15	5
II.	Overview of developments in the implementation of the Standard Rules	16–51	6
	A. Discussions with Governments	16–23	6
	B. Arab Decade for Persons with Disabilities (2004-2013)	24–29	7
	C. Disabled persons' organizations/government dialogue	30–40	8
	D. Monitoring the progress in implementation of the Standard Rules	41–45	10
	E. Facilitating the work of legislators	46–47	10
	F. Interregional cooperation through joint parliamentary committees	48–51	11
III.	The Standard Rules, the Supplement and the Convention	52–56	11
IV.	Non-governmental organizations: strengthening disabled persons' organizations	57–79	12
	A. Conferences and congresses of disabled persons' organizations	57–59	12
	B. The Panel of Experts	60–65	13
	C. Regional consultations	66–70	13
	D. Interregional cooperation	71–73	14
	E. Raising awareness through the media	74–75	14
	F. Changing attitudes through media	76–79	15
V.	International and regional organizations	80–84	15
	A. Networking	80–82	15
	B. Disability and development	83–84	16
VI.	Conclusion	85–89	16
VII.	Recommendations	90–125	16
	A. Recommendations to Governments	91–112	17
	B. Recommendation to Governments, disabled persons' organizations and collaborators	113–116	19
	C. Recommendation to international organizations	117–119	20
	D. Recommendations to the United Nations and Member States	120–122	20
	E. Recommendation to the private sector	124–125	21

I. Introduction

1. I would like to begin by thanking the Commission for Social Development for its support and guidance throughout this year, and all the Governments that supported my activities, especially the Government of Qatar for its continued financial support to the Office of the Special Rapporteur.

2. One year ago, when I stood here before you to present my first report to the Commission on Social Development, I was both honoured and awed by the responsibility entrusted to me and the enormity of the task I was undertaking. I was also keenly aware of the challenges ahead and eager to meet them.

3. I am pleased to report to you on the progress made during this year — it has been over 10 years since the adoption of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities and 20 months since my appointment as Special Rapporteur — at a moment in history when the disability movement worldwide is at its most vital and when Governments and civil society are collaborating to draft an International Convention aimed at promoting and protecting the rights and dignity of persons with disability.

A. Guiding principles

4. Throughout my work and regardless of the nature of the activities, there have been two main principles that guided my work. The first is the approach taken in carrying out the tasks and activities, and the second is the overarching goal towards which all activities are aimed.

1. The approach

5. During the past year I have striven to adopt a constructive and affirmative approach, preferring to highlight the positive and celebrate the successes, while at the same time emphasizing the need for greater achievement and more concerted efforts.

2. The overall goal

6. While continuing to monitor, assess, evaluate and advocate for more meaningful and deeper implementation of the Standard Rules, I have not lost sight of the fact that the ultimate goal of all the work being done is the equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities.

7. Equalization of opportunities is a universal concept measured against universal norms, which should apply to all cultures and countries equally. The challenge is that we live in an increasingly diverse universe where levels of development, cultural values, attitudes, norms, needs and services differ from one region to another, one country to another, and even within the same country.

8. While some countries are trying to perfect the conditions of equalization of opportunities for their disabled populations, there are other countries in which most have not been able to achieve basic human rights. This makes the job of monitoring the implementation of the Standard Rules extremely challenging.

9. Add to this the complexity and diversity within the disability movement itself and among the different types of disabilities. In many cases accessibility takes on a different meaning for people with different disabilities living in different geographical areas. This recognition of diversity has given rise to a richer culture within the disability movement, but it also requires that we monitor the equalization of opportunities in different ways by applying a variety of methods and looking at it from different angles and dimensions.

10. It has become increasingly clear to me that there is no one-size-fits-all way of dealing with and responding to the needs that are important to people with disabilities. I have attempted throughout my activities to keep this reality in mind.

B. Setting priorities

11. Based on a study of the disability movement, the work of the former Special Rapporteur and the recommendations he has made over the past 10 years, and in accordance with the mandate entrusted to me by the Commission on Social Development, I designed a work plan focusing on the following activities:

(a) Furthering the worldwide implementation of the Standard Rules;

(b) Monitoring and assessing the progress of implementation;

(c) Advocating;

(d) Raising awareness;

(e) Helping Governments identify barriers and obstacles to equalization and working with them on finding means of removing them;

(f) Strengthening interregional cooperation;

(g) Building the capacity of disabled persons' organizations.

12. At the same time, the issues of persons with disabilities in developing countries, particularly children, women and persons with intellectual, developmental and psychosocial disabilities, were given special consideration.

13. I have also decided that there is a need to focus on poverty and poverty reduction as they relate to issues of disability and the life situation of persons with disabilities. This is, therefore, the rationale behind the focus on specific target populations in developing countries.

14. The present report will:

(a) Summarize the main activities undertaken during the past year;

(b) Present the new initiatives developed;

(c) Discuss ongoing activities and planned activities;

(d) Identify the challenges faced by the international community, the disability movement, the emerging new international disability rights movement and the Special Rapporteur;

(e) Conclude with some recommendations on what I believe needs to be and can be done.

15. In fulfilling the duties of my mandate, I have undertaken the following activities:

(a) Initiating programmes, projects and activities;

(b) Consulting with Governments and policy and decision makers;

(c) Delivering speeches and lectures;

(d) Strengthening disabled persons' organizations and NGOs and participating in their meetings and congresses;

(e) Conducting regional consultations;

(f) Conducting surveys and in-house research;

(g) Coordinating with international and regional development organizations and agencies;

(h) Using the media to further the issues and raise awareness, granting interviews to the media and holding press conferences;

(i) Strengthening the relationship and involvement of the Panel of Experts in all aspects of the work;

(j) Communicating and corresponding with organizations and institutions regarding issues of disability;

(k) Supporting the work, initiatives, causes and demands made by persons with disabilities and their organizations and bringing them to the attention of their governments, international organizations and the United Nations.

II. Overview of developments in the implementation of the Standard Rules

A. Discussions with Governments

16. In many developing countries the Government is often the major, if not the sole, actor when it comes to setting policies, enacting legislation and delivering programmes. Due to the weakness of civil society in some countries in advocating and the lack of sufficient resources, issues relating to disabilities have often been pushed to the bottom of the list of government priorities.

17. In the last 12 months, I conducted several country visits. Some were in response to invitations from Governments or disabled persons' organizations, others were initiated on the basis of information and research or were based on the need to speed up, support or push forward certain initiatives or programmes.

18. The overall aim of the visits was to:

(a) Promote the Standard Rules;

(b) Advocate in favour of the equalization of opportunities;

(c) Discuss direct action with governments.

19. Other visits were in response to invitations to deliver speeches and lectures at conferences and congresses of disabled persons' organizations. Countries visited during 2004 include the following:

(a) Egypt (April);

(b) Jordan (April);

(c) Norway (June);

(d) Lebanon (June and August);

(e) Canada (September);

(f) Saudi Arabia (October);

(g) Guatemala (October);

(h) Mexico (October);

(i) Germany (November);

(j) United States of America (December).

20. All visits included meetings with government officials, including:

(a) Presidents and Heads of State;

(b) First Ladies;

(c) Speakers of the House and Congress;

(d) Ministers and deputy ministers in relevant Ministries;

(e) Officials representing the executive, legislative and judicial branches of government.

21. All meetings provided opportunities to encourage Governments to reaffirm their moral and political commitments to the implementation of the Standard Rules, and to share the state of their countries in relation to the issues of people with disabilities.

22. During these visits, discussions with officials centred on the need for comprehensive social change in order to achieve the equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities and the ways in which to effect that change, including the importance of involving and listening to disabled persons' organizations. The visits also provided an opportunity to meet with regional, United Nations and international development agencies to explore ways of mainstreaming disability into their development programmes.

23. It was important also to meet with local and national disability councils and rehabilitation centres in order to listen to, learn from and share information with disabled persons' organizations, community-based service providers and parents of children with disabilities.

B. Arab Decade for Persons with Disabilities (2004-2013)

24. Working closely with the Secretary-General of the Arab League, advocating for the issues of persons with disabilities in that region, and close consultations with

officials in April facilitated the adoption and declaration of the Arab Decade for Persons with Disabilities (2004-2013) at the summit meeting of the Arab League in May 2004. The Arab region is the last region in the world to adopt a decade for persons with disabilities and thereby place the issues of persons with disabilities among the priority policy areas of Arab Governments.

25. The adoption of the Decade provided the opportunity to start a dialogue at the highest levels with policy and decision makers and legislators. For example, working closely with the Speaker of Parliament of Lebanon and the President of the Federation of Arab Parliaments led to the formation of parliamentary committees in Arab Parliaments to legislate on disability issues. The commitment was put into practice and a decision was adopted at the Federation's meeting on 2 September 2004.

26. In that same context, and in order to shore up support for the Decade, meetings in Lebanon included discussions with the President of the Republic and the Prime Minister to promote and reinforce implementation of the Standard Rules.

27. I also met with the Head of the Parliamentary Committee on Education and with educators and school administrators working on integration and inclusion of children with disabilities into mainstream education through parental and community involvement. I also visited an innovative rehabilitation centre that provides social, occupational, psychological and physical rehabilitation to persons with disabilities.

28. Within the context of the adoption of the Arab Decade, a meeting was organized in partnership with the Arab League and the Arab Organization for Disabled Persons in Lebanon, funded through the United Nations Voluntary Fund on Disability. The purpose of the meeting was to formulate a plan of action for the Arab Decade and to strengthen the document by injecting the spirit and philosophy of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities into the articles of the Decade.

29. The meeting brought together:

(a) Disabled persons' organizations from across the region;

(b) Regional development organizations (the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), the International Labour Organization (ILO), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR));

(c) Representatives of the Asian/Pacific Decade and the African Decade;

(d) Members of the Panel of Experts representing international disabled persons' organizations (World Federation of the Deaf, World Blind Union, Disabled Peoples' International).

C. Disabled persons' organizations/government dialogue

30. Country visits facilitated disabled peoples' organizations to establish more direct dialogue with their Governments about their concerns and issues relating to

the implementation of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities in ways that would produce tangible change in their lives.

31. The visit to Guatemala was made in response to an invitation extended by the Office of the Human Rights Ombudsman (Division of Disability Rights) and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The visit included meetings with the Vice-President of the Republic, whose commitment to development and the rights of persons with disabilities set the tone for very constructive and fruitful meetings in that country.

32. I also discussed health and mental health issues with the Minister of Health with a focus on prevention and the provision of accessible and affordable health services for children, women and persons with disabilities, particularly in rural and indigenous communities.

33. The Deputy Minister of Labour and the President of the Congress expressed their support and recognized the need to provide gainful, meaningful employment for persons with disabilities, particularly the need to activate legislation dealing with the employment of persons with disabilities.

34. The same understanding and recognition were expressed by experts on inclusion and integration at the Ministry of Education. However, most initiatives and intentions remain constrained by the lack of financial resources.

35. A meeting with the Guatemala City Manager centred on disabled access in the city.

36. At all these meetings, a member of the Ombudsman's Office and the National Council for Persons with Disability was present.

37. An awareness of the need for change and the importance of the Standard Rules in Guatemala is constrained by the lack of resources, the enormity of the development agenda, the scale of the disability problem, particularly in the aftermath of over 30 years of armed conflict, and the abject poverty in some regions and communities that exacerbates disability.

38. The visit to Mexico enabled me to look more closely at a project in which Governments and disabled persons' organizations are jointly redesigning the physical, social and cultural environment to achieve the equalization of opportunities. The Mexican experience, in all its facets, is a very useful one for other countries to learn from, particularly in Latin America.

39. It is particularly noteworthy that in Mexico, the National Commission on Disability is directly linked to the Office of the President of the Republic and is headed by one of his closest aides.

40. The visit to Mexico was made in response to an invitation from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Disability Commission in the Office of the President of the Republic. Meetings were held with several ministries and governmental institutions, including:

(a) The President of the Republic;

(b) A representative of the Office of the First Lady;

(c) The cabinet minister responsible for disability;

(d) The Ministry of Education (Inclusion and Integration);

(e) The National Statistics Bureau;

(f) The Ministry of Health and experts in rehabilitation;

(g) The Ministry of Transportation.

D. Monitoring the progress in implementation of the Standard Rules

41. The need for accurate statistical data and information on disability has been reflected in the discussions at the Ad Hoc Committee meetings, in which representatives of both Governments and disabled persons' organizations have emphasized their importance in developing policies, legislating for disability and providing services to people with disabilities.

42. In that context, and as follow-up to the work of the former Rapporteur in this area, a global survey on government action on the implementation of the Standard Rules has been disseminated worldwide.

43. The survey covers the 22 standard rules, posing two questions in relation to each rule, covering policy, legislation, programmes, budget allocations, involvement of disabled persons' organizations and their effect on the lives of persons with disabilities. It has been sent to Governments or government bodies in all Member States and to two disabled persons' organizations per country.

44. In the instructions sent out with the survey, I made a recommendation to government bodies and departments to hold a workshop to bring together all governmental organizations involved in legislating on and providing services to persons with disabilities to answer the questions contained in the survey. This, I believe, will enhance intergovernmental cooperation and the quality of the responses. Responses from disabled persons' organizations to the same questions will increase the reliability of the answers.

45. The survey itself is both a monitoring and an awareness-raising tool, reminding Governments of the Standard Rules and the importance of the equalization of opportunities and the achievement of full participation in all aspects of life for persons with disabilities.

E. Facilitating the work of legislators

46. The establishment of committees in Arab Parliaments to legislate on disability issues does not mean that the laws will be drafted and enacted. In a region that lacks mechanisms and experience in this field and in which many negative attitudes towards disability still prevail, there is a need to build capacity and facilitate the work of these legislators on those issues.

47. Therefore, I am currently collaborating with the UNESCO Regional Office in the Arab States and ILO to design a series of workshops for legislators and parliamentarians to explain the concept, importance and impact of and practices relating to the equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities and how these can be strengthened through legislation and relevant rules and regulations.

F. Interregional cooperation through joint parliamentary committees

48. Closely related to this process is the interregional cooperation being developed between Arab and European Parliaments. Because the equalization of opportunities is a global concept, it is important to open channels between regions to exchange information and experience on policies, to learn about legislation and to apply tried and true methods by example.

49. This exchange forms a basis for joint cooperation between the European and Arab Parliamentarians. During my recent visit to Germany, a series of meetings were held with members of the German Parliament specialized in disability legislation, in order to initiate this collaboration.

50. An agreement has been reached to involve German Parliamentarians in workshops and exchange programmes with the Arab region. These visits will also be used as public awareness-raising occasions through extensive media coverage.

51. This activity is also one that will be replicated in other regions of the world.

III. The Standard Rules, the Supplement and the Convention

52. It is impossible to present a report of this sort without touching upon the relationship between the Standard Rules, the Supplement to the Standard Rules and the Convention, and the role of the Special Rapporteur.

53. The role of the Special Rapporteur was stipulated in section IV of the Standard Rules. I believe that this document is a landmark in the history of disability awareness. The Rules were adopted after a long struggle and are the fruit of the efforts of the international community and dedicated disability rights advocates. This document has provided the international community with a set of norms and guiding procedures with regard to what needs to be done in order to improve the quality of everyone's life in society, including that of persons with disabilities.

54. Ten years of application and implementation of the Standard Rules have changed the landscape of disability awareness and the attitude of people regarding the nature, causes and implications of all types of disabilities. Yet this application revealed some shortcomings, which required the introduction of a Supplement. The progress made by the Standard Rules also reignited interest in drafting the Convention.

55. Today many are expressing uncertainty about the relationship between the Rules, the Supplement and the Convention.

56. I have no doubt that the two documents are complementary. While the Convention fulfils the need for a legally binding document, the Standard Rules (and their Supplement) represent the software for actualizing the text and the spirit of the Convention.

IV. Non-governmental organizations: strengthening disabled persons' organizations

A. Conferences and congresses of disabled persons' organizations

57. Specialized forums are the best place to reiterate the importance of the Standard Rules as a tool for achieving the equalization of opportunities. On that basis, I have tried whenever possible to participate in congresses, meetings and conferences.

58. During the past year I have had the opportunity to speak or present papers and lectures at 12 major international and regional events, and will continue to participate in many such activities until the end of my mandate.

59. Papers and lectures presented to date (September 2003-November 2004) include:

(a) "Recent developments in the Standard Rules", International Seminar on the Convention, Tokyo;

(b) "The right to participate and contribute to cultural life", The Right to Culture Conference, Amman;

(c) "Human rights for people with disabilities", UNHCR, Geneva;

(d) "The Standard Rules and Convention", Working Group Meeting on the Convention, Cairo;

(e) "Rehabilitation for persons with disabilities in developing countries", Rehabilitation International Conference, Oslo;

(f) "Disability in developing countries", keynote address at the Disabled Peoples' International Congress on Disability and Diversity, Winnipeg, Canada;

(g) "Including issues of women with disability in women's development programmes", regional meeting of the ten-year review of the Beijing Platform for Action, Beirut;

(h) "Injecting the spirit and philosophy of the Standard Rules into the Arab Decade for Persons with Disabilities", Arab Decade Expert Meeting, Beirut;

(i) "Children with psychosocial disabilities: global perspective", Conference on Children with Autism, Riyadh;

(j) "Importance of research and statistics", at the launch of the International Disability Rights Monitor research results, New York;

(k) "Equalization of opportunities: a goal for all action", opening address at the National Rehabilitation Centre, Second Regional Meeting of Experts, Mexico City;

(l) "Disability: reality and aspiration", Presidential Palace, Mexico City;

(m) "Updating the Standard Rules", Congress of the Federation of Deaf and Hard of Hearing People, Helsinki;

(n) "The Standard Rules: content, importance and present status", Asian Blind Union, Damascus.

B. The Panel of Experts

60. A Special Rapporteur on Disability would not be able to fulfil the responsibilities entrusted by the Commission on Social Development without the help, cooperation, advice and counsel of organizations of persons with disabilities and the panel of experts representing those organizations.

61. I was able to share many of my plans with them and have received their support on many issues. Three members of the panel were instrumental in supporting the efforts and facilitating the discussions at the meeting of experts held to formulate a plan of action for the implementation of the Arab Decade.

62. The draft of the Global Survey on Government Action on the Implementation of the Standard Rules was sent to the members of the panel of experts for their comments and feedback.

63. An Internet group was established to facilitate communications and exchanges of views with the panel of experts.

64. In some developing countries, the voices and opinions of disabled persons' organizations are slowly being heard and their views taken into consideration. This is not always true in all countries.

65. It is one of the priorities of my mandate to support disabled persons' organizations in developing countries to gain a foothold within the political advocacy system of their countries by providing them with the forums in which to voice their opinions and increase understanding of their needs and rights, and by facilitating exchanges between them and government officials and decision makers whenever disability issues are being discussed.

C. Regional consultations

66. Regional consultations have helped me understand the reality of disability on the ground from the real experts in the field and identify the challenges facing their organizations. They also bring together representatives of disabled persons' organizations to exchange views, ideas and information and share experiences. The aim of the regional consultation with disabled persons' organizations that took place in Mexico and the meeting with members of the National Council for Persons with Disability in Guatemala was also to listen to the issues brought out by the persons most concerned and relay, as well as possible, those issues to government officials and the United Nations development organizations.

67. To that end, disabled persons' organizations from the Arab region were invited to the expert meeting held in Beirut in August 2004 to develop a plan of action for the Arab Decade for Persons with Disabilities.

68. Participation at the second regional meeting of experts on integrated rehabilitation in Mexico was an opportunity to hold a regional consultation with disabled persons' organizations from the region. The consultation included representatives of disabled persons' organizations from 25 countries in Latin America and the Caribbean. Each presented three of the most pressing issues for people with disabilities in their countries. Detailed reports on those issues are

currently being sent to the Office of the Special Rapporteur and the information will be used in research that is being carried out on the state of disability in the world.

69. Meetings with disabled persons' organizations in Guatemala included member organizations of the National Council for Persons with Disability and addressed the concerns of disabled persons, including education, health, sign language, accessibility, and the issues of disabled persons in rural and indigenous communities.

70. In Mexico and Guatemala, representatives of disabled persons' organizations were present during government negotiations on health, accessibility, rehabilitation and education with various officials and ministries.

D. Interregional cooperation

71. A dynamic inter- and intraregional exchange on disability issues has been taking place together with the growing realization that the commonalities and differences among regions can be used as fertile grounds for learning. As Special Rapporteur, I am in a position to facilitate this exchange by providing a context for the learning experience to take place.

72. This was exemplified by the invitation extended to the Asian/Pacific and African Decades to participate in the meeting to draw up the plan of action for the Arab Decade. The panel of experts also participated in that meeting.

73. This participation brought regional and international experiences to the meeting and helped enrich the discussions that took place. Lessons learned and obstacles that may face implementation, as well as ways and means of overcoming them, helped steer the discussions towards more practical and results-oriented issues.

E. Raising awareness through the media

74. Awareness-raising takes many forms and uses many tools, but none is more powerful than the media in delivering the message and changing attitudes, outlooks and mindsets. One of the goals I established for the country visits was to use the local media at every possible opportunity to effect change.

75. In Egypt, Guatemala, Jordan, Lebanon and Mexico, the media played a significant role in raising awareness of the Standard Rules and the issues of persons with disabilities. At every opportunity I also tried to organize and hold press conferences and media interviews to relate what I had seen and to report on the issues discussed. At the press conference in Guatemala, the concerns, issues and needs of the indigenous community of Santiago Atitlan, where parents of children with disabilities have mobilized an entire community to respond to the needs of the children, and those of the community of ex-combatants with disabilities, were brought to the forefront and became the subject of newspaper articles and television news reports. This helped raise awareness of pressing issues, publicized the successes achieved by the communities and reminded the authorities of what needs to be done to live up to the commitments they made during our negotiations.

F. Changing attitudes through media

76. Equalization of opportunities is a concept that requires a change in attitude and behaviour. Existing attitudes and current behaviour are the result of ideas that people have inherited about disability and its causes. Changing attitudes requires ridding society of discrimination and prejudice and breaking down walls of superstition and ignorance. The media is the most powerful tool to effect this change and has been successful in changing attitudes at the public and social levels in many regions.

77. Based on this understanding, and in accordance with my mandate to promote the equalization of opportunities and encourage change at all levels, I have been promoting a massive media campaign to raise awareness and change both the image that people have of persons with disabilities and the image that persons with disabilities have of themselves.

78. The media campaign will be launched on local and satellite stations in the Arab region, where disability is still shrouded in shame and superstition and thought to be a curse and a misfortune for the entire family.

79. The campaign will encompass one-minute television spots that will highlight each of the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities and demonstrate the abilities and potentials of persons with disability once opportunities are made available.

V. International and regional organizations

A. Networking

80. With the advances made in the drafting of the International Convention, there is growing international recognition of the rights of persons with disabilities as human rights. There is also a growing recognition that the issues of people with disabilities are either excluded or marginalized by international or regional development agencies and organizations.

81. It was brought to light, for example, at one of the meetings, that the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) does not have specific programmes targeting women with disabilities, nor are the issues of women with disabilities mainstreamed into the women's development programmes run by UNIFEM.

82. Establishing direct contact and encouraging networking between disabled persons' organizations and development organizations has become a priority activity. In Lebanon, as in Guatemala, meetings held with UNDP, ILO, UNESCO, UNICEF, UNIFEM, the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) revealed the need for inter-agency coordination and willingness among United Nations agencies to find ways to avoid compartmentalization. As a result, joint projects on education inclusion and employment and training are currently under way with UNESCO and ILO in the Arab region.

B. Disability and development

83. Furthermore, raising awareness among the various development organizations on the need and the ways to mainstream and include disability issues in programmes dealing with poverty, health and nutrition, education, employment and training, environment and human rights has become a priority activity.

84. Building on the importance of mainstreaming disability issues into development programmes, a second survey has been distributed to 48 regional development organizations. The 13-question survey asks whether they have included disability issues in their programmes, how or why not, what kind of budget allocations have been made and whether the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities were taken into consideration in designing their programmes.

VI. Conclusion

85. For me the past year was exciting and full of challenges. Through my work, I was encouraged by the determination of many dedicated leaders, advocates and activists. Their work demonstrated the limitless ability of the human spirit to overcome any obstacle. It is this tireless ability to strive for the betterment of our world and to create spaces in which all can be accepted as equals that I aspire to emulate through my work.

86. The task is not an easy one and the challenges are many. Only through a collaborative effort can we hope to create a world that will accept each of us with our diverse abilities, our weaknesses and strengths, and allow us to exercise that diversity in creating such a world.

87. All the achievements to date in this domain constitute only a small dent in the huge task that needs to be accomplished. Making true progress towards an enabling world requires the combined efforts of all at every level — international, regional, national, communal and familial.

88. Finally, I would like to say that despite the commitments shown by Member States to the promotion and protection of the rights and dignity of persons with disabilities and to the equalization of opportunities for full participation, most have not matched that commitment with a financial one.

89. I invite and encourage all Member States to make contributions to the United Nations Voluntary Fund for Disability in order to continue the valuable work of promoting and advancing the equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities.

VII. Recommendations

90. On the basis of the activities of the past and the knowledge gathered through consultations, I have compiled a list of recommendations.

A. Recommendations to Governments

1. Health and prevention

91. While the past two decades have witnessed a drop in child mortality rates, communicable diseases and water-borne diseases, the levels are still high in some African, Asian and Latin American countries. While health care and prevention have been a target and a priority goal stated by many international, regional and national programmes, they are not being tackled with any consistency.

92. Moreover, the programmes for action emanating from the World Summit for Children, the World Summit for Social Development and the World Conference on Women have all specified mother and child health, pre-, post- and neonatal health as priorities. These, too, remain outstanding commitments. Not dealing with these issues has led to an increase in disability among children.

93. **Commitments need to be renewed and efforts doubled to provide appropriate health care capable of preventing disabilities. For countries that claim that they do not have the resources to deal with issues of disability, I would say that addressing the causes and working on prevention can be far less costly.**

94. In addition to malnutrition, pollution and environmental factors and the lack of adequate pre- and post-natal health care, a large percentage of disabilities in many countries also results from drug abuse and road- and work-related accidents.

95. **Targeted, well-defined government and NGO-sponsored awareness-raising programmes that effect change, alter attitudes and influence behaviour can play a major role in curbing many behaviours that lead to disabilities.**

96. Given that over 60 per cent of disabilities are preventable and can be avoided through awareness-raising and early intervention, the importance of raising awareness at the public and national levels regarding the causes of disability, as well as more serious work at the level of prevention, should be emphasized.

97. Other traditional practices that lead to disabilities among young girls and children are early marriage and early childbearing.

98. **Governments need to get involved in a massive, culturally sensitive and directed public-awareness campaign addressing traditional customs and pointing out the fact that even time-honoured practices can be dangerous.**

2. Wars and violent conflict

99. In considering disability prevention, we cannot ignore one of the main causes of disability in many regions of the world today. There are more than 60 wars and armed conflicts raging throughout the world, to which a large percentage of disability can be attributed. There may be very little we can do about the realities of world politics. However, I believe there are lessons we can learn from the disability movement.

100. The root of most violent conflicts is inequality and social injustice, and dealing with these matters in an equitable and just manner may go a long way in curtailing some of the violence. **The equalization of opportunities is one way of dealing**

with unfair and unjust social systems and promoting a non-violent resolution of conflicts.

101. **Expanding our understanding of the equalization of opportunities to include all people and all aspects of human interaction and human development will certainly contribute to improving the lives of more than just the 600 million persons with disability around the world. Using the same rights-based approach that the disability movement espouses to include and guarantee full participation for marginalized and neglected groups can make a big difference.**

3. Statistics

102. Accurate statistical data and precise information on which policies and services can be based and delivered remain a major challenge for the disability movement as whole. One consolation is that there is a growing awareness of the need for accurate statistical information on disability, as demonstrated by the discussions of the ad hoc Committee meetings. The Disability Rights Monitor research in Latin America is an excellent source, and other regions need to follow suit.

103. Some of the numbers provided by the United Nations Statistics Division that are based on government reporting vary from 33 per cent disability in the most developed countries to 0.5 per cent in the least developed. This does not bode well for the accuracy of such information. Considering the link between poverty and disability, such numbers tend to blur the realities and diminish the impact that sound development and poverty reduction strategies can have on the lives of persons with disabilities.

104. **I would urge Governments, through their national statistical bureaux and in collaboration with disabled persons' organizations and social and human development organizations, and with the help of regional United Nations organizations, to conduct specific, targeted, methodical data collection and analysis and to use that information to formulate policies and provide services to persons with disabilities. The United Nations Statistics Division can play a leading role in developing the capability of Governments and organizations to gather, compile, analyse, publish and disseminate data and statistics on disabilities.**

4. Relationship between Governments and disabled persons' organizations and NGOs

105. Closely related to the failure of awareness-raising to make a significant dent in the area of prevention is the sometimes adversarial relationship that exists between NGOs and disabled persons' organizations and their Governments.

106. In some countries, disabled persons' organizations are seen as adversary groups trying to undermine the role of Government and are accused by Governments of exaggerating problems in order to turn people against them and undermine their authority.

107. In many instances, the task of raising awareness and educating about prevention falls to NGOs and disabled persons' organizations that not only lack the resources and financial support needed for such a task, but are deprived of suitable

moral support by Governments, which themselves are incapable of reaching all people.

108. Democratization and participation means allowing others to shoulder some of the responsibilities and allowing people to speak for and represent themselves. Disabled persons' organizations represent a subculture whose contributions are valuable to the mainstream culture and also provide opportunities in which persons with disabilities can grow and develop their potential, advocate for their own issues and determine their contribution to society at every level.

109. It is important that further progress be made to develop a more cooperative and supportive relationship between Governments and their national disabled person's organizations. Such a relationship could be advantageous not only to persons with disabilities themselves, but to society as a whole, and in turn to Governments themselves.

5. Inclusion in education and full participation

110. Equalization of opportunity is aimed at creating a society inclusive of all, and education is the means by which to achieve such inclusion. It prepares society to accept differences and diversity. It helps individuals gain the knowledge, skills and mindset to act and interact with others, which is a requirement for full participation.

111. While some educational institutions and education ministries have accepted this concept of integration and inclusion in theory, implementation has fallen short. In many cases, when inclusion is implemented it is done without any training or grounding for persons with disabilities themselves, other students in the educational institution or teachers. There have been cases where parents have taken their children out of school when a child with a disability was introduced, or where teachers have categorically refused to admit a child with a disability into the classroom.

112. Governments need to get involved by legislating inclusion into education that leads to full participation. Legislation needs to go hand in hand with guaranteeing all forms of accessibility within the educational system. It also needs to be coupled with awareness-raising and training for society as a whole and for staff of the educational system.

B. Recommendation to Governments, disabled persons' organizations and collaborators

Rehabilitation

113. An encouraging development within the disability movement is the rethinking and revision of our understanding and practice of rehabilitation. It is not surprising that one of the unanimous positions taken during the ad hoc Committee meetings was for rehabilitation to be treated as a separate article from health and medical care.

114. A new understanding has emerged that community-based rehabilitation needs to deal with issues related to the lives of disabled peoples in all their aspects and to take into consideration the context in which people with disabilities live.

115. Some of the most successful community-based rehabilitation programmes are those in which families and the community play a central and vital role, in addition to the persons with disabilities themselves. A World Health Organization (WHO) report stated that 70 per cent of rehabilitation needs in developing countries can be met at the community and family level if people are given the moral, psychological and emotional tools and the confidence that they can rehabilitate not only persons with disabilities, but rehabilitate the community to accept them, to provide them with equal opportunities and to receive them as productive, active members.

116. **Disabled persons' organizations, the medical establishment and Governments need to be made to move away from the purely medical model of dealing with issues of disabilities and recognize that the disabled are persons first, and that their inclusion in society should be based on that criterion. Therefore, rehabilitation should address the person as whole at the social and professional levels, as well as the medical and therapeutic levels. Additionally, the medical establishment is called upon to respect, understand and make use of the psychological, emotional and professional energy available within the family in support of its members with disabilities.**

C. Recommendation to international organizations

Poverty

117. There is a definite and inextricable link between poverty and disability. Symptoms of poverty, such as inadequate medical care, unsafe environments and malnutrition, are all causes and exacerbators of disability. Poverty reduction programmes have begun to take disability into consideration, and organizations of persons with disability are being consulted on these issues. One example is the World Bank's Global Partnership for Disability and Development — an initiative aimed at incorporating the issue of disability into mainstream development.

118. However, many of these initiatives, despite their good intentions, have fallen short of fully addressing the issue. It is worth noting that the World Bank/International Monetary Fund Millennium Goals do not mention disability as a target area either overtly or covertly.

119. **There is a need to include disability, both programmatically and financially, in all the poverty reduction and development programmes, and to specifically spell out targets for persons with disability in the same way that they are spelled out for other vulnerable and marginalized groups.**

D. Recommendations to the United Nations and Member States

1. Routinizing monitoring and evaluation

120. The Standard Rules created a mechanism to monitor their implementation and provided for the appointment of the Special Rapporteur. However, monitoring the world situation in relation to the Standard Rules and the lives of persons with disability in a complex and diverse world, in which cultural interpretations of equality vary along a spectrum and country specificities dictate realization, should not be left to the Special Rapporteur alone.

121. A monitoring body at arm's length from policy makers and legislators should be established within each country. It should include representatives from disabled persons' organizations, service providers and educators and be allocated a budget to conduct its monitoring activities. It should also be given the authority to issue reports and assessments regarding the measures taken to equalize opportunities for persons with disabilities.

122. Specific assessment measures should be developed for each country upon which to base the monitoring activities. In this way, information on the ground would be made available to the Special Rapporteur to be used in promoting, raising awareness of and advocating for issues of persons with disabilities.

2. Revising our approach

123. Inter-agency cooperation should be strengthened. Despite the growing emphasis on disability rights as human rights, the development dimension should also be further emphasized, and initiatives such as those of the World Bank need to be strengthened. United Nations development agencies not only need to mainstream disability issues into their programmes, but should do so by working jointly on issues where their spheres of competency coincide.

E. Recommendation to the private sector

Including new partners

124. With many countries in the world moving towards a market economy, Governments can no longer afford the high cost of social programmes. The real financial power is in the hands of the private sector. Until now in many parts of the world, and in developing countries in particular, the private sector has been absent from offering any kind of support. It is time for this vital sector of the economy to get involved. This kind of involvement represents a social and moral obligation and would be a sound economic decision.

125. I urge business leaders everywhere to contribute to the equalization of opportunities for persons with disabilities, not only through financial donations and contributions. It is necessary to provide career and job opportunities for persons with disabilities, to enhance workplace accessibility and to sponsor training programmes to enhance the skills and build the capacities of persons with disabilities, which would allow them to contribute to the economy and take responsibility for their own independent lives.

United Nations E/CN.5/2005/6

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
1 December 2004

Original: English

Commission for Social Development
Forty-third session
9-18 February 2005
Item 3 (a) of the provisional agenda*
Follow-up to the World Summit for Social Development and the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly

Review of further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly

Report of the Secretary-General

Summary

The present report is prepared in response to Economic and Social Council decision 2004/241, which adopted the agenda of the Commission for Social Development for its forty-third session, the priority theme of which is "Review of further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly".

While the report reviews and analyses the implementation of each of the 10 commitments from the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development in the last decade, it does so in a broad and comprehensive manner rather than following a strict commitment-by-commitment approach. The report consists of four major chapters: (1) the comprehensive policy framework for people-centred development set forth by the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development and the Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development; (2) the current prospects for an enabling environment for social development as envisaged by the Summit; (3) major trends in social development since the Summit with respect to poverty, employment, social integration, gender equality and education and health; and (4) the way forward in

---

* E/CN.5/2005/1.

terms of policy recommendations. In addition to the four chapters, an annex is included, presenting historical background on the international agenda on social development leading up to and including the World Summit for Social Development; the 10 commitments from the Copenhagen Declaration in their original wording; and an overview of the significance of the five-year review of implementation, after the Summit, at the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly held at Geneva in 2000.

Contents

Paragraphs *Page*

I. Introduction 1–6 4

II. A comprehensive policy framework for social development 7–33 5

A. The international social development regime envisioned at the World Summit for Social Development 13–18 6

B. A policy framework centred on equity and equality 19–27 7

C. Social development and the Millennium Development Goals 28–33 9

III. An enabling environment for social development 34–114 10

A. The political and institutional environment for social development Commitments 1 and 10 .... 38–58 11

B. The economic environment for social development Commitments 1, 7, 8 and 9 .... 59–109 16

C. Conclusion 110–114 27

IV. Observed trends in the three core issues and other commitments addressed by the World Summit for Social Development 115–229 28

A. Eradication of poverty Commitment 2 .... 117–139 28

B. Expansion of productive employment and reduction of unemployment Commitment 3 .... 140–164 33

C. Social integration Commitment 4 .... 165–190 38

D. Gender equality Commitment 5 .... 191–202 44

E. Universal access to education and primary health care Commitment 6 .... 203–226 47

F. Conclusion 227–229 52

V. The way forward: implementing people-centred development 230–241 53

Annexes

A. International agenda on social development leading to the World Summit for Social Development 62

B. The ten commitments of the 1995 Summit in Copenhagen 63

C. Five-year review: the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly in 2000 65

I. Introduction

Purpose and mandate

1. The forty-third session of the Commission for Social Development marks the tenth anniversary of the World Summit for Social Development. Therefore, it is altogether fitting and logical that the priority theme for the session is "Review of the further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly".

2. In addition to contributing to the deliberations of the Commission on the priority theme, the report has been prepared to assist the Commission in responding to General Assembly resolution 58/130, which called upon the Commission to transmit to the General Assembly, through the Economic and Social Council, the substantive outcome of its review of the further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly for its consideration in 2005.

3. During the preparations for the review, an expert group meeting was convened by the Secretariat in June 2004 in New York within the framework of the International Forum for Social Development on the theme "Equity, inequalities and interdependence". The results of that meeting have been incorporated into the report.

Organizational structure of the report

4. While the report covers the implementation of each of the 10 commitments from the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development,[1] it does so in a broad and comprehensive manner rather than following a strict commitment-by-commitment approach. The report contains four chapters. Chapter one describes the comprehensive policy framework for social development set forth by the Copenhagen Declaration and the Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development.[2] The chapter presents social development as an international regime; analyses the policy framework with respect to the values, principles and goals of equity and equality; and analyses the Millennium Development Goals[3] from a social development viewpoint.

5. Chapter two examines the enabling environment for social development. It analyses the political and institutional environment as well as the economic environment prevailing at the international, regional and national levels. Chapter three presents major trends in social development since the Summit with respect to poverty, employment, social integration, gender equality and education and health, and examines factors that have influenced those trends. Chapter four looks at the way forward. It proposes an agenda for social development that deepens the people-centred approach advanced by the Summit. Specific policy recommendations are made with respect to governance issues central to an enabling environment for social development and to the three core issues of poverty eradication, employment and social integration, with a special focus on Africa.

6. In addition to the four chapters, an annex is included for reference. Section A of the annex presents a brief historical background on the international agenda on social development leading up to and including the Summit; section B presents the 10 commitments from the Copenhagen Declaration in their original wording; and

section C briefly outlines the significance of the review of implementation five years after the Summit at the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly held at Geneva in 2000.

II. A comprehensive policy framework for social development

7. Ten years ago, world leaders came together in Copenhagen for the first World Summit for Social Development, a meeting that raised hopes and expectations and made actual commitments for the improvement of the human condition. Today, while those hopes and expectations are perhaps not dashed, they are certainly diminished as a number of trends are negatively affecting social development, notably socio-economic deprivation and inequality among individuals, social groups, entire communities, countries and even some continents. In addition, threats to civil liberties derived from security interests are on the rise.

8. The fact remains that, today as in the mid-1990s, no human being should be condemned to endure a brief or miserable life as a result of his or her class, country, religious affiliation, ethnic background or gender. Overcoming the biases associated with those circumstances requires a normative and policy approach that puts human beings at the centre of development, one that considers economic growth as a means and not as an end in itself, an approach for which the ultimate goal is to increase, protect and attain the opportunities for improving the quality of life of current and future generations.

9. Subscribing to the notion that human beings are at the centre of development requires a multifaceted approach to development. For example, the approach should be socially sustainable in reducing poverty and inequality and in promoting social justice. It should be culturally sustainable, conserving values, practices and symbols of identity that determine social cohesion and national identity through time. It should be politically sustainable, deepening democracy, transparency and accountability, and thereby guaranteeing the access to and participation of all sectors of society in public decision-making. Finally, the approach should be environmentally sustainable, taking into account access to and use of natural resources and preserving biodiversity. This multifaceted approach implies that the economic objectives of growth should be subordinated to the criteria of human dignity and improvement in the quality of peoples' lives. Unfortunately, all too often the reverse tends to be the case.

10. In reviewing the further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly, the stark reality emerges that the establishment of an enabling environment for social development in line with the vision set forth at the Summit, including the availability of financial resources, remains a formidable challenge. Thus, the review projects an overall mixed record with some positive developments, but also with many hopes and expectations left unfulfilled. Nevertheless, the Summit succeeded in raising awareness and in emphasizing the importance of addressing social development issues and implementing social development policies, culminating in the inclusion of several social development objectives in the Millennium Development Goals. On an aggregate basis, there has been progress, as measured by statistical indicators, in some areas of social development, including the reduction of extreme poverty and greater overall access to primary education.

Nonetheless, progress has been less than expected and has often been uneven between regions, and even more so across countries. In particular, in sub-Saharan Africa, there has been little — if any — improvement, and some indicators have even regressed, meaning that the Summit's commitment to accelerate development in Africa has been left wanting.

11. Furthermore, situations of inequality have remained pervasive, raising considerable obstacles to attacking the structural causes of poverty as well as causing direct negative impacts for disadvantaged and vulnerable sectors and for such specific groups as youth, older persons, people with disabilities, indigenous peoples, migrants and displaced persons.

12. Equally disquieting is that the all-encompassing approach to development as advanced by the Summit has been lost or severely weakened in the international policy-making arena. While poverty has taken its rightful place of prominence, the comprehensive socio-economic understanding of poverty promoted by the Summit stands in contrast to the narrower concept and measurement currently used. In addition, the other two core themes of the Summit, namely full employment and social integration, have been by and large left aside, if not ignored.

A. The international social development regime envisioned at the World Summit for Social Development

13. The concept of social development forged at Copenhagen was a highly inclusive and far-reaching attempt to capture fully the meaning of development. It included all dimensions required by society to improve the quality of life of its individual members while simultaneously fostering social justice, cohesion and integration, promoting productive employment and empowering the social groups that made up its citizenry.

14. Of course, the concept and the struggle for social development is not of recent vintage but goes back several centuries, continuously enlarging the prospects for equity and equality in human relations. Thus, the Summit was neither the starting point nor the final destination of social development. What was unique to the Summit was the political will exhibited by all Governments to give integral treatment to the social challenges of development, which until then had often been dealt with in a piecemeal and sectoral fashion, as if social development were merely the end result of actions taken in such areas as education, health and social protection. Even if the understanding that social development was much more than the aggregate result of social policies was not new, it was the Summit that enshrined the framework in international relations and multilateral decisions.

15. Consequently, the outcomes of the Summit represent a set of norms and explicit commitments that are characteristic of an international social development regime to guide national, regional and internationally agreed policies, rights and obligations. The breadth of the meaning of social development is evident throughout the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development. The commitment of Heads of State and Government attest to its breadth, especially when they advocated "a political, economic, ethical and spiritual vision for social development that is based on human dignity, human rights, equality, respect, peace, democracy, mutual responsibility and cooperation, and full respect for the various religious and ethical values and cultural backgrounds of people".[4] The Heads of State and Government

further stated their commitment to strengthening those values and ideals by pledging to assign "the highest priority in national, regional and international policies and actions to the promotion of social progress, justice and the betterment of the human condition, based on full participation by all".[4]

16. The Summit, notably through its three core issues — poverty eradication, employment and social integration — deals with social development in a comprehensive manner, treating it as both an objective and a process involving all sectors and actors of society. In terms of objectives, social development refers to the well-being of the person and to the harmonious functioning of society. It includes improvements in individual and family well-being through the enjoyment of human rights, the provision of economic opportunities, the reduction of poverty and access to social protection and social services. It also includes the building and maintenance of social relations, structures and institutions through which individuals and groups constitute a viable society. The pursuit of those objectives naturally requires economic means.

17. As a process, social development implies the continuous promotion of a more equitable distribution of opportunities, income, assets, services and power in order to achieve greater equality and equity in society. It also entails the active involvement of Governments and international and regional organizations, as well as of a broad cross-section of civil society, including the private sector, to promote greater inclusion and participation in building more democratic and equitable societies.

18. The Summit clearly affirmed that in both economic and social terms, the most productive policies and investments were "those that empower people to maximize their capacities, resources and opportunities".[5] It was no longer simply a case of postulating ways and means to incorporate social dimensions into economic development. That one-sided approach had actually hampered the prospects for improving the quality of life throughout the world. Since the Summit, the traditional dependency of the "social" on the "economic" has been inverted, and the focus of the debate is now increasingly on the several economic dimensions of social development, be they trade, finance, technology or numerous others. The significance of the economic dimensions for society rests not on their intrinsic economic merits but rather on how they best promote productive activities to satisfy human social needs.

B. A policy framework centred on equity and equality

19. The concepts of equity and equality set out in the Copenhagen Declaration and the Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development reflect a set of values, principles and goals that constitute the foundation of the policy framework of the Summit, and are rooted in the principles and values of the Charter of the United Nations, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and the outcomes and agreements produced at several prior international conferences. Central to those values, principles and goals is equality of rights, conditions and opportunities, which refers broadly to the ways in which people are able to participate in society as citizens and exercise their entitlement to resources and to their ability to contribute to the well-being of their communities, their families and themselves.

20. The emergence of a society for all — the central message of the Summit that every human being is entitled to participate in, contribute to and benefit from economic, social, cultural and political development — brought equity and equality to the core of the policy agenda. The Heads of State and Government attending the Summit clearly recognized that equity, equality, social justice and human dignity, rights and fundamental freedoms constituted the fundamental values that should be shared and nurtured by all societies. Those values not only enhanced social cohesion but also contributed to reducing or eliminating many root causes of social conflicts; they actually provided the necessary means for satisfying the basic needs of all, promoted socially responsive markets, fostered the creativity of people and protected the environment.

21. It was within that context of equity and equality that the Summit defined as its first core issue the challenge of eradicating poverty. Together with confronting the structural and multidimensional causes of poverty, the attainment of a "more equitable distribution of productive assets, wealth, opportunities, income and services" became the overriding goal of the Summit's fight against poverty.[6] In addition, it recognized that striving to equalize the distribution of income and wealth and minimizing structural inequities was complicated by both inequality before the law (that is, the inability to exercise rights and participate fully as citizens) and inequality of opportunity and conditions (that is, the inaccessibility of means and resources considered necessary to overcome structural social, economic, political, cultural, ethnic and racial barriers).

22. The second core issue of the Summit focused on employment. That implied promoting equal access to employment as a means for individuals to maintain their own livelihood, both economically and socially, and as a crucial factor in ensuring social, political and economic stability. Macroeconomic policies were considered key to enlarging employment opportunities, promoting labour mobility and enhancing access by women to traditionally male-dominated occupations. Specific actions envisaged to enhance employment opportunities for groups with specific needs were also seen as necessary to the design of policies and programmes.

23. Social integration, the third core issue of the Summit, was aimed at fostering social cohesion while recognizing, valuing and protecting diversity in all of its social, cultural, political and ethnic dimensions. Policies that strengthened the participation and involvement of civil society in the decision-making process would make leaders accountable and increase transparency in decision-making processes while increasing opportunities for representation of the underprivileged sectors of society. Non-discrimination, tolerance, mutual respect and diversity would raise awareness and promote "equity and equality of opportunity and social mobility".[7]

24. The three interrelated pillars were to be supported by an enabling environment founded on a framework of equity and equality. Issues relating to the reduction and eradication of poverty, the underlying causes that separated the excluded and poor from those who were integrated and prosperous, in addition to the conditions needed for people to reach their potential in the world of employment, could be separated neither from the need for democratic institutions nor from core issues related to macroeconomic policies and to policies in education, health, the environment and social justice.

25. The integration of social, economic, cultural and political aspects into social development was considered essential for an enabling environment conducive to

human dignity, human rights, freedoms and social justice. An enabling environment for social development therefore required policies that promoted the equitable and non-discriminatory distribution of the benefits of growth among social groups and countries, including providing expanded access to productive resources for people living in poverty.[8]

26. The Summit took into consideration, at the national level, the need to establish a legal framework that provided a set of rules and regulations to fight exploitation and corruption. It also called for a progressive tax system with efficient and fair tax collection so that the poor would not pay an inordinate part of their income in taxes and levies. At the international level, it promoted an economic environment with an equitable and durable approach to debt and debt-servicing by developing countries to rectify the debt burden serviced at the expense of social programmes. It also called for trade policies that promoted greater access to markets and reduced trade barriers, and for an increase in official development assistance (ODA).

27. The preceding brief analysis indicates that the policy framework of the Summit has not only influenced the discourse of a number of conferences of the past decade but has also advanced, in varying degrees, issues ranging from ageing, gender equality and food security to housing and sustainable development. At other conferences and debates, including those related to financing for development and international trade, the agendas have addressed the need to consider social development along with economic goals. Nevertheless, while the conferences subsequent to the World Summit for Social Development may share many of its values on equity, equality and social justice, several core issues of its framework have not been sufficiently addressed. Among those that should be mentioned are the need of employment for all and the role of public institutions in fostering social development.

C. Social development and the Millennium Development Goals

28. As mentioned previously, the Summit advocated a comprehensive concept of social development, one that encompassed key issues, ranging from human rights to equality, peace, human dignity and ethical values — all elements needed to promote the betterment of the human condition.

29. Although that comprehensive vision may remain as a guiding force for policy-making in the social development sphere, it is nonetheless clear that in the years since the Summit the concept of social development has gradually become less comprehensive. The shift is reflected, for example, in the Millennium Development Goals and in the World Bank poverty reduction strategy papers (PRSPs), which tend to approach poverty eradication from a mainly economic vantage point.

30. It should be recognized that the United Nations Millennium Declaration[9] and the Millennium Development Goals relating to such social concerns as poverty and hunger, literacy, health, and infant and maternal mortality — to be achieved by 2015 — resemble the quantitative targets of the Summit on meeting basic human needs as represented by literacy, infant and maternal mortality rates and life expectancy.[10] However, the focus of the United Nations Millennium Declaration on the definition of poverty as less than one dollar per day represents a departure from the comprehensive approach advanced at the Summit. While that definition of poverty has helped to raise awareness and has spurred debate by contrasting that

amount to the daily incomes in developed countries, it differs from the broader definition set out in the Summit, which characterized poverty not only by a lack of income and consumption, but also by a lack of participation in society, and related those elements to various structural causes in both national and international domains.[11] Moreover, a definition of poverty based mainly on monetary dimensions does not address inequality of income or wealth. Finally, by focusing on absolute poverty it does not address relative poverty, thereby glossing over the reality of relative poverty that is pervasive in affluent countries.

31. The other two core issues of the Summit, employment and social integration, have also suffered from a discrepancy between economic and social policy-making. On the issue of employment, the Programme of Action declared that "productive work and employment are central elements of development as well as decisive elements of human identity. Sustained economic growth and sustainable development as well as the expansion of productive employment should go hand in hand."[12] However, the centrality of employment to economic and social development is absent from the Millennium Development Goals, except insofar as it advocates the development of decent and productive work for youth. Although the promotion of youth employment is certainly a fundamental objective, it is not a substitute for the more overarching goal of expanding productive employment for all sectors of society. The latter concept of employment has been used continually by the International Labour Organization, most recently in the 2004 report of the World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization.[13]

32. A similar observation can be made pertaining to social integration. The Copenhagen Declaration called for the "protection and full integration into the economy and society" of all groups, yet the fundamental contribution of social integration to both economic and social development has failed to influence later policy documents. Aside from the commitment to promote gender equality and the empowerment of women, the Millennium Development Goals make no reference to efforts to build more inclusive, participatory, stable, just and democratic societies.

33. Notwithstanding the above caveats, there is no doubt that the establishment of the Goals represents a positive, concerted effort to fill what many in the international community refer to as the "implementation gap" accumulated after several world summits and conferences. On many fronts the world situation has not improved significantly, not because of the decisions that were not taken, but rather because implementation and enforcement levels still fall short of the intended goals. The Millennium Development Goals deal with a few specific areas and spell out quantitative targets and a timeframe for achieving them, thereby contributing considerably to better coordinated multilateral actions and national policies. However, the Goals, despite their galvanizing effect, are not a substitute for the social development agenda, which is much broader and goes beyond them.

III. An enabling environment for social development

34. The World Summit for Social Development and its outcome documents emphasized that national Governments bore the primary responsibility for social development in their countries. Partnerships with, and participation of, such non-State actors as the private sector, non-governmental organizations and other civil society organizations were also recognized as important to the successful

implementation of policies and programmes called for by the Summit. Moreover, the Summit recognized that international cooperation had a major role to play in supporting national social development efforts, especially in Africa and the least developed countries.

35. Thus, in reviewing the implementation of the Summit agreements, it is necessary to describe national and international policies and actions that have been taken towards promoting social development, while also examining the political, economic and social contexts in which those policies have been forged. The impact of the policies and actions on social development will also be explored, with a view towards highlighting the interrelationships among the commitments and identifying areas for further strengthening of the social policy agenda.

36. Developments in the international economy, debates in the development discourse and other various national and international factors have influenced the implementation of the outcomes of the Summit over the past 10 years. Those factors have both contributed to and detracted from the creation of an "enabling environment" for social development. A brief analysis of the factors will help explain the forces underlying recent trends in social development.

37. National circumstances also have a great impact on the pace of progress in social development. Natural and human-made disasters such as armed conflict, earthquakes, floods, droughts and the human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (HIV/AIDS) often set back development or make progress towards social objectives even more challenging. National governance and policy frameworks can promote or hinder social development, depending on the quality of governance and the policies formulated within such frameworks.

A. The political and institutional environment for social development Commitments 1 and 10

38. The Summit made "creating an economic, political, social, cultural and legal environment that will enable people to achieve social development"[14] the first of its Commitments, underscoring the importance it placed on an enabling environment. In the decade since the Summit, changes have taken place that have affected the environment for social development.

1. Democratization, human rights and fundamental freedoms[15]

39. The Copenhagen Declaration stated that democracy and transparent and accountable Government are indispensable foundations for the realization of social development.[16] The world now has more democracies and more political participation. In 1980, 54 countries, with 46 per cent of the world's population, had some or all of the elements of democracy; by 2000, that number had grown to 121 countries, with 68 per cent of the world's population. Taken together, the 1980s and 1990s have been called the "third wave" of democratization, although there is no evidence that the trend is continuing. Global progress on political freedoms has been uneven, and the pace of democratization appears to have stalled. Many countries have failed to consolidate and deepen the first steps towards democracy, and several are slipping back into authoritarianism. The progress made during the 1990s appears to be losing momentum and, in some parts of the world, may actually be moving backwards.

40. It must be emphasized, however, that democratic political participation requires more than the election of Governments. Respecting and upholding human rights is crucial not only for individual well-being but also for the citizens of a country to be active and engaged. Democratic politics require civil, cultural, social, economic and political rights, such as freedom of association, freedom of assembly and freedom of expression, for the equitable and effective participation of all citizens, including women, minorities and the most disadvantaged sectors of society, as well as access to assets and opportunities for the material improvement of individuals and communities.

41. While democratization is important for the promotion of social development for everyone, it can be particularly important in providing a means of empowerment for poor people. According to the World Bank, the poor often face enormous barriers when attempting to have their views taken into account. In view of those circumstances, the World Bank has argued that Governments have a key role in providing the necessary institutional framework to facilitate the formation of representative associations so that the voice of the poor may be heard.[17] That view has been reconfirmed by another recent World Bank report, which suggests that experience with participatory processes has indicated that the poor and the marginalized, even when invited to express their views, have no institutional outlet through which to follow up.[18]

42. Finally, making policy that is consistent with social development goals also requires a decision-making system that incorporates the principles of participation and transparency as well as consideration for equity and equality. Even under a democratic system, social development goals, which often reflect the concerns of the weaker and marginalized citizens and groups in society, are at risk of being relegated to a position of lesser priority — relative, for example, to measures focused solely on economic growth — owing to the inadequate voice of and participation by those most affected. In situations where democratic institutions and processes are still lacking, the risk becomes even greater.

2. The role of civil society and the State

43. The trends described in the preceding section have been linked to other tendencies as well. The trend towards economic liberalization that characterized the 1990s also brought about a movement to take the social dimension into account in economic and structural adjustment policies. That development is closely related to appeals by civil society and non-governmental organizations, which have seen their numbers rise substantially over the past decade. The momentum of civil society has also helped to promote greater self-awareness of rights and relative inequality among people, which has been reinforced by the current atmosphere of human rights entitlements and access to instant information on a global scale. These elements have combined to promote greater participation through initiatives to strengthen civil society.

44. At the same time, while the last decade has seen a greater interest in improving the status of various social groups — demonstrated by attention to the rights of indigenous peoples and persons with disabilities and to poverty among older persons and youth unemployment — there is less interest in policies to equalize the distribution of income and wealth. The focus of many political struggles has shifted

away from the latter to a focus on other kinds of differences and inequalities, most prominently those of race and gender, with attention to political and civil rights.

45. Notwithstanding, in the last two decades a very important shift has occurred in a crucial aspect of modern societies: the way citizens and social groups choose to be represented and defend their interests nationally and internationally. Prior to the last two decades of the twentieth century, trade unions represented civil society interests, not only on such issues as employment and wages, but also on many other issues related to social development, such as pensions, health care and social protection. The trade unions appear to have been affected by the long-term trend of declining relative size in union membership, as measured by union "density rates" — the percentage of workers who belong to unions.[19]

46. However, during the past two decades other types of civil society organizations and non-profit groups have flourished in a social environment that favoured non-State actors and emphasized partnership in fulfilling many of the responsibilities traditionally carried out by the State. Their participation in national and international arenas has become crucial in defending the interests of groups whose voices otherwise might never be heard. In effect, throughout the major world conferences of the 1990's, civil society organizations have articulated new ideas and proposals, argued and negotiated, protested and exercised political pressure, giving birth to an unprecedented international public space.

47. It should be stressed, however, that the relative decline of some traditional forms of societal representation, together with the emergence of non-State actors, does not necessarily imply the abolition of or weakening role for the State. On the contrary, what has grown in recent years is the recognition, despite the ideological changes of the last decade, that the State still holds key responsibilities in regulatory matters and in its role of articulating diverse productive, community and social sectors.[20]

48. Public regulation or State-led policies still offer a contribution to the development process that is unique, necessary and indispensable: unique because its logic transcends the logic of market forces, particularly in such dimensions as ethics, equity, equality and social justice, which are foreign to market mechanisms and institutions; and incorporates as well the defence of the so-called "diffuse rights" intrinsic to citizenship; necessary because the very logic of capital accumulation requires the provision of "public goods" that cannot be produced by competitive actors in the marketplace, particularly in the imperfect markets of emerging economies and less developed countries; and indispensable because it addresses such issues as risk and vulnerability, social exclusion and destitution, and many other issues not amenable to the microeconomic calculus, particularly when future generations (who, by definition, cannot participate in today's market) are brought to the forefront of social concerns.

49. Moreover, challenges posed by social inequity and inequalities cannot be defined as individual problems, embodying instead social, collective challenges. It is not the case of simply allowing the access, via the marketplace, to education, housing, health or to an environment free of pollution, but rather the restoration of solidarity — collective practices of fulfilling the material and spiritual needs of human well-being.

3. International, regional and subregional cooperation

50. In Commitment 10, Member States agreed to improve the framework for international, regional and subregional cooperation for social development in a spirit of partnership with the United Nations and other multilateral institutions. Governments agreed that the task of social development was, first and foremost, a national responsibility, but acknowledged that strategies were needed for international development cooperation and that resources should be used more effectively for implementation of the Summit commitments.[14]

51. Commitment to an improved and favourable environment for social development has been amply demonstrated by partnerships between United Nations agencies, international and civil society organizations and the private sector through innumerable global, regional and national conferences. However, much work remains to strengthen the authority, structures and processes of institutional machinery — including the United Nations bodies concerned with the integration of economic and social development issues — if the goals of the Summit and those of the United Nations Millennium Declaration are to be realized. Closer working relationships are required to address adequately the interrelationships of poverty, employment and social integration and to sufficiently strengthen the coalition of multilateral institutions as a powerful force for equity and social justice.

52. The Summit envisaged an integrated and comprehensive framework for follow-up and assessment of the implementation of its outcome. The Programme of Action designated the General Assembly as the principal policy-making and appraisal organ on matters relating to the follow-up, which led to the twenty-fourth special session in 2000. In addition, the Economic and Social Council was called upon to "review the mandate, agenda and composition of the Commission for Social Development, including considerations of the strengthening of the Commission, taking into account the need for synergy with other related commissions and conference follow-up".[21]

53. Further, the United Nations system, including the specialized agencies and the Bretton Woods institutions, were requested to expand and improve their cooperation in the field of social development to ensure that their efforts were complementary, and where possible, to combine resources in joint initiatives for social development around common objectives of the Summit.[22] To that end, in its resolution 50/161 of 22 December 1995 the General Assembly decided that the Commission for Social Development, together with the Economic and Social Council and the Assembly itself, should constitute a three-tiered intergovernmental follow-up process. The Commission was charged with the primary responsibility for the follow-up to the Summit and the review of the Copenhagen Declaration and Programme of Action; the Council was to provide overall guidance and coordination; and the Assembly would have a role in policy formulation.

54. Although the outcomes of the work of the Commission over the 10 years since the Summit have all been sent to the Economic and Social Council, they have not been substantively pursued there. Of particular significance to the Summit's call for a people-centred approach to development is the need to integrate social and economic policies as emphasized during the fortieth session of the Commission in 2002. Among other recommendations, the agreed conclusions stressed the need to "broaden the scope of sound macroeconomic policy to integrate social and economic policy"[23] and reaffirmed that both social and economic development were

essential in the effort to eradicate poverty, promote full employment and enhance social integration.

55. Despite a thorough debate and the adoption of valuable agreed conclusions on the question of integration of economic and social policies, that approach has not been pursued, nor has it been addressed sufficiently by other international institutions or even at other levels of the United Nations system. At the same time, the General Assembly has repeatedly stressed the need for the Council to strengthen its role with its subsidiary bodies to ensure coordinated follow-up to major United Nations conferences. Pursuant to General Assembly resolution 57/270 B, the Council will receive in 2005 the outcome of a review by each of its functional commissions of its methods of work, with the ultimate goal of maximizing the impact of those methods on the implementation of conference goals.

56. Collaboration between the Council and other organizations is particularly relevant in today's complex world and should reflect the need to deal simultaneously with the economic, financial and social aspects of development. Achieving these objectives requires strengthening and revitalizing various parts of the United Nations system, including the Council, which has been the subject of repeated reform but has not yet experienced any recognizable increase in authority. For example, ministries responsible for social issues are familiar with the reports of the Commission, but there is little evidence that the outcomes have reached senior decision makers or civil servants involved in economic and financial matters. Similarly, the links required between social ministries, ministries of finance and ministries of planning for fuller integration of social and economic policies are weak, at best.

57. The above-mentioned trends reveal the relative gap between current political thought and practice, which hampers joined-up policy-making and limits the ability of a people-centred approach to rise above the level of abstract thinking. Progress towards achieving the main goals of the Summit — reduction of poverty, full employment and social integration in stable, safe and just societies — is uneven. Achievements in social development continue to be characterized by a disparity between intentions and actions, between proclaimed objectives and the actual orientation of national and international policies. The optimum outcome, where all individuals have access to equal rights and opportunities and share the benefits but also contribute to economic development, and where investment in social development leads to growth and equity, does not seem to be pursued.

58. Institutions, nationally and internationally, can make the appropriate linkages for integrated policy development and frameworks, but they must allow for effective systems of coordination between economic and social authorities in all spheres and for policies that facilitate greater visibility of the social effects of economic policy and their integration into development processes. Internationally, the high-level segment of the Economic and Social Council can serve, for example, as an ideal forum for regular meetings of finance and trade ministers, and ministers responsible for labour and social policies, in order to review policy coherence among them.

B. The economic environment for social development Commitments 1, 7, 8 and 9

59. On the eve of the World Summit for Social Development, the dominant perspective on development focused on the virtues of the market in guiding that development, an apparent consensus derived from a deep disappointment in the results of State-led development, including fiscal imbalances, the profound external debt crisis of the 1980s and inefficiencies and distortions brought about by State intervention in the economy.

1. Market reforms, structural adjustment and social development

60. The structural reform programmes devised to overcome those crises promoted an approach to development based on the premise that market forces would lead to the most efficient allocation of resources, thereby resulting in faster economic growth, which would ultimately bring about overall development. That development strategy was implemented most vigorously during the 1980s through structural adjustment programmes and lending conditionalities closely associated with the Bretton Woods institutions. Developing countries were advised to pursue privatization, trade and financial liberalization and fiscal contraction in order to increase economic efficiency, correct macroeconomic imbalances and reign in inflation. In major industrialized countries, policies also started to shift to an era of deregulation, privatization and scaled-down direct government intervention in the economy.

61. The early 1990s also saw the collapse of the centrally planned economic model and the end of the cold war. Those world events further reinforced the belief that market forces should drive national economies as well as international economic relations.

62. Nevertheless, the actual experience in countries that undertook structural adjustment during the 1980s and in economies in transition that started embracing market capitalism in the early 1990s demonstrated the importance of institution-building and social cohesion in attaining the goals of economic reform. Consequently, the attention drawn to social issues at the Summit helped to shift the intellectual discourse away from the orthodoxy of promoting economic growth that ignored, or even jeopardized, social development. In this regard, Commitment 8 of the Summit explicitly states that structural adjustment programmes, when agreed to, should "include social development goals, in particular eradicating poverty, promoting full and productive employment, and enhancing social integration".[1]

63. The new financial crises of the 1990s and subsequent economic recessions in Asia, Latin America and the Russian Federation further demonstrated the social devastation that unrestrained and at times heavily speculative international capital flows, coupled with rigid macroeconomic policy, could bring. The human impact of the crises of the 1990s, including unemployment, increased poverty, worsening inequality and the erosion of social cohesion in many countries, underscored the importance of meeting Commitment 8 of the Summit.

64. In effect, structural adjustment programmes implemented in the 1980s and early 1990s were predicated on the belief that economic growth rates for countries undergoing structural adjustment would be higher and that, once fiscal imbalances were addressed, the expected higher growth rates would be sufficient to produce

social benefits. As actual experience proved otherwise — particularly in areas in sub-Saharan Africa and in many parts of Latin America and the Caribbean — policy makers gradually realized that pursuing economic stabilization policies at the expense of social policies also produced long-term negative consequences. Those realizations have led such institutions as the World Bank to shift towards supporting social development as part of their overall poverty reduction strategies.[24]

65. In December 1999, in an attempt to address the persistent poverty in developing countries after many years of painful adjustment and reform, the boards of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund approved a new approach to the challenge of reducing poverty in low-income countries based on country-owned poverty reduction strategies, known as the poverty reduction strategy papers. The name of the International Monetary Fund country assistance programme was also changed from "Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility" (ESAF) to "Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility" (PRGF). By July 2004, a total of 40 countries had completed their first full poverty reduction strategy paper and, of those, 18 had completed their first annual implementation progress report. An additional 14 countries had completed their interim poverty reduction strategy papers.[25]

66. The World Bank, in the *World Development Report 2000/2001: Attacking Poverty*, also adopted some of the multidimensional elements of poverty, including exposure to vulnerability and risk, low levels of education and health, and powerlessness. However, describing poverty in those terms still does not fully acknowledge its structural aspects, namely the unequal distribution of assets — land, capital, technology, education — and of access to participation in policy-making. Similarly, the poverty reduction strategy papers, much in line with the Summit's call to include social development in structural adjustment programmes,[26] have yet fully to reflect the multifaceted character of poverty.

67. Further to adopting poverty reduction through pro-poor and pro-growth programme measures, such as those that have as their main objectives government budget allocation and fiscal flexibility, a new feature of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility is the use of social impact analysis of major macroeconomic and structural reforms. However, internal reviews indicate that the systematic incorporation of such analysis into programme design remains one of the areas most in need of improvement.[27]

68. External reviews of poverty reduction strategy papers and the Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility point to a general concern by civil society over the imposition of structural adjustment conditionalities, given their proven negative impact on poverty. There is also criticism that the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund did not match their commitment to poverty and social impact analysis with actual implementation. For instance, the Nordic Governments' review of World Bank and International Monetary Fund support to poverty reduction strategy paper processes revealed that only theoretical linking of macroeconomic and structural adjustment measures to poverty reduction was made, while empirical evidence on actual policies chosen was lacking.[28] The review led the World Bank to acknowledge the perception that, in addition to the "implementation gap" with respect to world summits, there could now be an emerging "rhetoric-reality gap".[29]

69. To heed the commitments that Governments and their development partners made at the Summit requires genuine efforts to incorporate social development priorities into national development strategies. To meet that challenge, the poverty

reduction strategy paper process and the implementation of the Poverty Reduction and Growth Facility and the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative need to emphasize more, not fewer, social development goals. Participatory processes with respect to a broad range of domestic stakeholders, as well as development partners, need to be institutionalized and strengthened. Participation should also be deepened beyond information-sharing and consultation into decision-making.

2. Asymmetric globalization

70. During the last two decades of the twentieth century, the world experienced a dramatic expansion of international trade and rapid increases in foreign direct investment (FDI) flows, with information and communication technology greatly facilitating the movement of goods and financial capital across national borders. Economic globalization greatly increased and intensified during the period, as foreign direct investment, especially in developing countries, increased rapidly and total world trade grew faster than world gross domestic product. In contrast, social and political institutions remained largely national and did not provide needed oversight of the global markets to redress inequalities among countries, which tended to be magnified through the functioning of the global marketplace.

71. The current imbalance of globalization can also be seen in terms of the asymmetry in the international policy agenda, at present dominated by free trade, protection of intellectual property rights, investment protection and financial market liberalization. Other items of strong interest to developing countries, such as international labour mobility, remittances, international taxation on financial flows and financing mechanisms to compensate currently marginalized countries and social groups, as well as mechanisms to ensure macroeconomic policy coherence among major economies, are conspicuously absent from the current agenda. Furthermore, not all issues under a particular agenda item are considered with the same degree of urgency. For example, trade in product items of great importance to developing countries, such as labour-intensive manufacturing, faces its most protectionist challenges in developed countries, yet trade negotiations continue to focus on products and services of greater concern to developed countries, such as financial services.[30]

72. The asymmetries of globalization at the present time and the lack of public oversight have contributed to a situation in which the costs and benefits of globalization, in economic, social and human terms, are not equitably shared among countries and peoples. Globalization in its current form has been blamed, at least partly, for the widening gap between the rich and poor countries, as measured by the inequality of average incomes across countries. There is also evidence that within-country income inequality has increased in a majority of countries since the mid-1980s.[31] More specifically, Africa has been left out of the globalization process, and the gap between African countries and the others has widened.[32] Latin America, with an initial condition of high inequality, experienced a further polarization of employment and income between those employed in the tradable and formal sectors (strengthened by the participation of multinational corporations during liberalization) and in the non-tradable and informal sectors.[33] In Asia, a region widely recognized for having embraced an outward-looking development strategy, within-country income inequality increased in most countries.[34]

73. An important link between globalization and within-country income inequality has been the growth in international trade and cross-border financial flows. A measure of a country's degree of participation in globalization is its export growth and foreign investment inflows. However, propelled by international market forces, such as the drive to minimize international transport costs or to have an abundant supply of relatively inexpensive or unprotected labour, foreign direct investment projects and export-producing enterprises often concentrate in certain geographic areas in a country, sometimes further encouraged by government policy measures such as tax incentives granted to export-processing zones. This may lead to uneven growth and thus to income inequality.

74. While it is true that a country's ability to make policy choices is somewhat constrained in the current international trade and financial system, it is also recognized that global competitive pressure tends to restrict those choices, a factor that often adversely affects social development since considerations and regulations regarding social policies and social equity are usually viewed as costs. As a result, social development policies are often mistakenly considered to be in conflict with the preservation of a country's international competitiveness.

75. Financial liberalization has also reduced the scope for counter-cyclical monetary and fiscal policies. One reason for this is that financial liberalization and the decline in official flows have elevated the importance of private financial capital for many developing countries, especially in the emerging market economies. Another factor that constrains counter-cyclical policies is, to some extent, the intense tax competition among developing countries to attract foreign investment, which often reduces total tax revenues. The trend is further reinforced by the mainstream development strategy that aims to reduce the role of the State. The reduced scope of Governments to pursue counter-cyclical macroeconomic policies has restricted their policy options in the fight against poverty and unemployment, two key areas of social development.

76. The desire of developing countries to attract foreign investment and expand exports has frequently led to a "race to the bottom", in which labour protection and environmental standards are often ignored or compromised to make the countries more competitive in the international market. In that sense, external competitive pressures have restricted the ability to pursue aspects of social policy and have therefore impeded progress in social development. The recent trend among international organizations and even among private, voluntary schemes of establishing their own labour standards and environmental rules, while welcome, attests to the possible impact of the race to the bottom if market forces are left unchecked — otherwise there would not be a need for such proposals in the first place.[35]

77. The Equator Principles,[36] adopted in October 2002 by a number of major investment banks, are noteworthy among the voluntary schemes that corroborate the suggested notion that there is a "race to the bottom", and that initiatives must be taken to counter the tendency. The 17 social and environmental principles are built on criteria and guidelines designed by the World Bank and the International Finance Corporation. The principles are intended to serve as a common framework for the implementation of social and environmental procedures and of standards for project financing activities across all industry sectors globally. The British agency Dealogic, which produces statistics and analysis of the project finance market,

estimates that the 23 banks among the 25 financial institutions using the Equator Principles approved 55.1 billion United States dollars ($) in project loans in 2003, representing 75 per cent of the $73.5 billion project loan market volume in that year.[37]

78. The rules and policy prescriptions of the international organizations that govern globalization have also limited the space for national policy-making. For instance, the transformation of the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) into the World Trade Organization broadened the scope of international trade negotiations beyond the reduction of tariffs and other direct barriers to trade. Any issues that are considered possible impediments to the free flow of goods and services across countries now fall under the purview of the World Trade Organization. One of the consequences of the expanding reach of the World Trade Organization is that its rules would restrict national policy and regulations formulated for social objectives if they were judged to conflict with World Trade Organization agreements.

79. At the Summit, globalization was addressed in one comprehensive paragraph, in which the opening of "new opportunities for sustained economic growth and development" and the "cross-fertilization of ideals, cultural values and aspirations" were hopes that were balanced by the observations that "rapid processes of change and adjustment have been accompanied by intensified poverty, unemployment and social disintegration" and that there were "threats to human well-being, such as environmental risks [that] have also been globalized".[38] In evaluating the developmental impact of globalization, the tenth session of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), the Conference, in 2000, called for the international community to reconsider and elaborate development strategies and policies that take into account development's social, human and environmental dimensions.

80. Taking note of the prevailing asymmetries in today's world economy, the Conference called for more bilateral and multilateral efforts to safeguard vulnerable populations, and for the benefits of globalization to be more widely shared, stating that "there is no automatic process by which the income levels of developing countries will converge towards those of developed countries".[39] Furthermore, the Conference stressed the importance of effective social policies for economic growth by suggesting, for example, that "good health and the attainment of basic education are essential building blocks of development and indispensable for reducing poverty and inequality".[40]

81. The eleventh session of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, held in Sao Paulo in June 2004, built on its previous session by appealing for more coherence between national development strategies and global economic processes in order to achieve economic growth and development. It emphasized that most developing countries have not benefited from globalization and are still facing major challenges in realizing their economic potential, developing their productive sectors and creating employment for a large proportion of their population. Furthermore, the debate focused on ways to make trade work for development, particularly the capacity of international trade to contribute to poverty alleviation and reduce instability in world commodity prices.[41] Those themes have been reiterated recently by the International Labour Organization in the report of the

World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization, which stressed the importance of policy coherence in achieving a far more inclusive globalization.[42]

82. While the Conference agreed that development was the primary responsibility of each country, it also recognized that domestic efforts should be facilitated by an enabling international environment based on multilaterally agreed and applied rules.[43] To achieve that sound global economic governance, the eleventh session of the Conference concluded that it was necessary to improve coherence between national and international efforts and between the international monetary, financial and trade systems, so that they were more capable of responding to the needs of development.

83. In conclusion, notwithstanding its problems, asymmetries, threats and opportunities, globalization is a fact, and participation is a prerequisite for benefiting from the process. National, regional and international efforts should aim at strengthening global governance and mechanisms to promote a more balanced and inclusive globalization. As the Secretary-General has stated, "millions of people around the world experience it [globalization] not as an agent of progress but as a disruptive and even destructive force, while many more millions are completely excluded from its benefits".[44] Although globalization's main engine is technology and the expansion and integration of markets, it is not a force of nature but the result of processes driven by human beings. Thus, "globalization needs to be controlled so that it can be put at the service of humanity, which means that it needs to be carefully administered, by sovereign countries at the national level, and through multilateral cooperation at the international level".[45]

3. Financial resources for social development

84. Adequate financial resources are a prerequisite for social development, although providing resources itself does not automatically lead to social development. In Commitment 9, the Summit called for "increasing significantly and/or utilizing more efficiently the resources allocated to social development in order to achieve the goals of the Summit through national action and regional and international cooperation".[46] Financing for social development can come from several different sources. In addition, there are cases, included below, where no distinction is made between resources for development in general and resources for social development in particular.

85. A key development regarding the allocation of resources for social development since the Summit and the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly was the International Conference on Financing for Development held in March 2002 in Monterrey, Mexico. The Conference adopted the Monterrey Consensus,[47] in which developed, developing and transition economy countries pledged to undertake actions in financing for development in domestic, international and systemic policy matters. The Conference also marked the first quadripartite exchange of views between Governments, civil society, the business community and institutional stakeholders on global economic issues. In December of 2002, the General Assembly set in motion an intergovernmental follow-up process, as called for in the Monterrey Consensus, to monitor implementation and carry forward the international discussion of policies for financing development: mobilizing domestic financial resources for development; mobilizing international resources for development; international trade; increasing international financial and technical

cooperation for development; external debt; and enhancing the coherence and consistency of the international monetary, financial and trading systems in support of development.

86. With respect to mobilizing international resources, both the Copenhagen Declaration and resolution S-24/2 on further initiatives for social development, adopted by the General Assembly at its twenty-fourth special session, called for increasing current levels of official development assistance (ODA) as soon as possible, thereby increasing the flow of resources available for social development. Total ODA flows[48] steadily declined between 1991 and 1997, the year in which ODA reached its lowest level of the decade, $51.6 billion. However, 1998 marks the beginning of a recovery in ODA, reaching $67.6 billion in 2003, the highest level of ODA to date.

87. As a share of the combined gross national product (GNP) of the 22 development assistance countries, resource levels averaged 0.33 per cent during the period 1987-1991, 0.29 during the period 1992-1996 and 0.23 during the period 2001-2002, showing a net decline.[49] With respect to attaining the internationally agreed upon target of 0.7 per cent of the gross national product of developed countries for overall official development assistance, only four countries (Denmark, the Netherlands, Norway and Sweden) met and surpassed that target over the past 10 years, and all have done so since the period 1987-1991. Luxembourg joined the group in 2000.

88. At the International Conference on Financing for Development, major aid donors pledged to increase levels of development assistance. According to the pledges, aid flows are set to rise to $70 billion by 2006, from the level of $52 billion at the time of the Conference. The proposed increase, if it materializes, will be the largest in the 43-year history of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Development Assistance Committee, which coordinates the development aid policies of the world's principal aid donors. However, even at the proposed 2006 level, aid would still be under 0.3 per cent of the Development Assistance Committee member countries' aggregate gross national product and, according to the OECD, will depend crucially on decisions to be taken in five OECD countries — France, Germany, Italy, the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland and the United States of America — as their funding for 2004 falls far short of meeting that commitment by 2006.[50]

89. There are also new trends with unprecedented implications for the challenges of financing the overall process of development. Reference is made here to the growing importance of remittances made by emigrants to their home countries. Data on remittances are incomplete and almost certainly underestimate the flows of funds through informal channels; however, the available data show that remittances are estimated to have reached $130 billion in 2002, $79 billion of which went to developing countries. For those countries, remittances have become the second largest financial flow, after foreign direct investment, and have surpassed official development assistance.[51]

90. Remittances to developing countries are relatively concentrated in certain regions: the largest amounts go to Latin America and the Caribbean, followed by Eastern and Southern Asia, while sub-Saharan Africa receives only 1.5 per cent of the total. The European Union accounts for the largest source of remittance payments, followed by the United States and countries in the Middle East.[52]

91. In addition to raising the levels of official development assistance, the Copenhagen Declaration and the twenty-fourth special session called for the appropriate reduction of excessive military expenditures in order to reallocate public resources for investment in social development.[14] However, in the past few years the reallocation has not taken place. From 1993, estimated world military expenditures[53] declined for five straight years from $762 billion to a low of $690 billion in 1998, at which point they again began increasing.[54] By 2002, the estimated level was $784 billion, surpassing the 1993 level for the first time. Available data indicate that world military expenditure in 2003 was nearly $900 billion, representing 2.6 per cent of global GNP, and it is expected to rise to nearly $950 billion in 2004. That figure represents almost 20 times the current level of development aid.[55]

92. Thus, the decline in military spending observed at the time of the Summit has now been dramatically reversed. The figures offer a sharp contrast with estimates suggesting that all the Millennium Development Goals could be met by 2015 if official development assistance were increased by $50 billion per year and sustained at that level,[56] which represents only a fraction — 5 per cent — of what the world is spending now on arms and other means of destruction. The reallocation of defence-related expenditures to social development requires the concerted action of the international community, not only as a means of funding social programmes, but to also address the Summit's concern for reducing armed conflict and violence.

93. Among the proposals for financing for development, it is important to recall the request by the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly for the careful study of an international tax on currency transactions. The general expectation was that, in addition to the tax on financial flows, taxes on the consumption of fuels generating carbon monoxide and on arms sales would generate enough funds to combat poverty and hunger worldwide. A recent study undertaken by the United Nations University World Institute for Development Research (UNU/WIDER) at the request of the Department of Economic and Social Affairs, following the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly, explored several potential options for new sources of development finance, including global environmental taxes and a global lottery.[57] That approach reflects Commitment 9 of the Summit, which called for taxation systems that were "fair, progressive and economically efficient" and "cognizant of sustainable development concerns".[14]

94. Finally, the tendency already alluded to in the present report in terms of a shift of power from the public to the private sector and of a greatly reduced role of the State in the economy has also produced impacts on the availability of resources for social development, not so much on the supply side of those resources, but rather on the increased demand for financial resources no longer provided by the State. That tendency is partly due to the recognition of past failures of the State's direct involvement in economic activities and the provision of social services. It is also partly motivated by a development perspective that views State involvement and intervention in society as inefficient when compared with market mechanisms. In addition, demographic changes, especially population ageing, have further necessitated changes to sustain the viability of social protection programmes in many countries.

95. The shift in power and responsibility is most visible in the provision of social services. While such services were traditionally provided by the public sector, the new orthodoxy favours the private sector, or at least the introduction of market

mechanisms in the delivery of services. As a result, public utilities and health services have been privatized or outsourced to private contractors in several countries. In others, user fees for such services as health care and education have been introduced, although the provision of the services has remained in the public domain. The shift of responsibility and power from the public sector to the private can also be observed in social protection systems in many countries, often through pension privatization schemes, a reduction in social assistance and the scaling back of public health programmes.

96. It should also be pointed out that the new emphasis on partnerships should not be used as justification for the State to withdraw from its responsibilities in ensuring the financing and provision of social services. While it is constructive to engage private sector and civil society organizations in social development, the State and the public sector still bear the primary responsibility for promoting social development. A proper balance between the public and private sectors should be sought in order to ensure that universality, solidarity and social inclusion are preserved.

4. Africa and the least developed countries

97. Having examined the more structural aspects of development that may strengthen or hinder the "enabling environment for social development" called for by the Summit, it is useful to explore the regional dimensions of development as well. In that regard, within the framework of supporting developing countries in their social development efforts, Commitment 7 of the Summit placed priority on meeting the needs of Africa and the least developed countries.

98. In the 10 years since the Summit, national Governments in sub-Saharan Africa and the least developed countries have pursued various policies and programmes to promote social and economic development.[58] They have engaged in macroeconomic restructuring and social sector reform to create an enabling environment for development within their respective national contexts. The international community has also lent support to those countries by providing financial and technical assistance. That support is reflected by an increase in the shares of total net disbursement of official development assistance from the developed countries to sub-Saharan Africa, from about 16-18 per cent in 1995 to 18-20 per cent by 2001.[59]

99. Nonetheless, the economic growth of those countries decelerated, from the annual rate of 5.3 per cent in 1995 to 4.3 per cent by 2000. Even with a recent recovery in growth rates, the 5.0 per cent rate in 2002 remains below that of 1995. In sub-Saharan Africa, growth rates declined from 3.8 per cent in 1995 to 2.8 per cent in 2002.[60] In per capita terms, income declined from $520 to $469 in Africa while stagnating at below $300 in the least developed countries between 1995 and 2001. In contrast, per capita income increased from $1,620 to $1,860 over the same period in middle-income developing countries. Other indicators of development and well-being, examined further throughout the present report, generally show little or no improvement and, in some cases, such as life expectancy in sub-Saharan Africa, an overall decline.

100. The slow and inadequate pace of progress in Africa and the least developed countries is of great concern. Economic interdependence has had a profound effect on the potential for prosperity in Africa, where capital flight is now the highest in the world. A recent study found that 39 per cent of private portfolios were held

abroad and that if Africa were able to bring back that wealth the private capital stock would increase by around 64 per cent. In 1997, capital flight of $22 billion was estimated for the severely indebted low-income countries of sub-Saharan Africa, an amount that constituted nearly half of their external resource requirements.[32] There is a need to review major initiatives targeting Africa and the least developed countries and to strengthen national and international policy frameworks to stimulate development in those countries.

101. In 2001, the national Governments and regional organizations in Africa initiated the New Partnership for Africa's Development (NEPAD), with the active support of international development partners. Within the NEPAD framework, the African Peer Review Mechanism was established and 16 countries had acceded to the mechanism by July 2003. Several countries have established national focal points for NEPAD, and regional economic communities have also begun to reorient their activities to reflect the priorities of NEPAD through summits and workshops.

102. During its fifty-seventh session in 2002, the General Assembly welcomed the African Union-led New Partnership for Africa's Development and affirmed that the support of the international community was essential to the implementation of the initiative. In effect, agencies of the United Nations system have aligned their activities with the priorities of NEPAD, using existing coordination mechanisms such as the United Nations Development Assistance Framework, at the national level, and regional consultative meetings led by the Economic Commission for Africa to coordinate responses key to NEPAD's successful implementation.

103. The HIPC Initiative also represents a major international initiative of great relevance to least developed countries in general, and to Africa in particular. In 1999, following a comprehensive review, a number of modifications were approved to provide faster, deeper and broader debt relief and to strengthen the links between debt relief, poverty reduction and social policies. Countries' continued efforts towards macroeconomic adjustment and structural and social policy reforms — including higher spending on such social sector programmes as basic health and education — are now central to the enhanced HIPC Initiative. Twenty-seven of the 38 potentially eligible countries had reached the decision point as at July 2004, with 14 reaching the completion point.[61] Debt for the 27 countries is expected to decline by about two thirds as a result, and the remaining 11 will probably be accommodated by a proposed extension of the sunset clause to the end of 2006. The Initiative's emphasis on expenditures in the social services has served to appreciably increase health and education spending in national budgets.

104. While the HIPC Initiative appears likely to provide much-needed respite from high debt service, debt relief is not a panacea for broader economic development problems, nor is one-time debt reduction a guarantee that the problem will not re-emerge. Indeed, a consensus is emerging that full implementation of the HIPC Initiative will not eliminate the debt overhang of all beneficiary countries.[62] Both internal and external reviews of the implementation of the HIPC Initiative have pointed out some of the limitations of the programme. For example, debtor countries consider the allocation of HIPC resources to be inflexible, potentially weakening domestic ownership of the Initiative and hence the achievement of its objectives. The slow pace of implementation, constrained by having to carry out a poverty reduction strategy paper for at least one year and by carrying out macroeconomic adjustment established under the International Monetary Fund Poverty Reduction

and Growth Facility conditionalities, has effectively reduced the impact of the Initiative, especially in the social sectors. In fact, internal reviews by the staffs of the World Bank and the Fund recommended a better balance between growth-enhancing and social expenditures, relative to the current emphasis on the latter.[27]

105. Despite the preceding efforts, external support for integrated initiatives has not been adequate. Financial resources for the HIPC Initiative declined between 1995 and 2003, even as the proportion of global aid going to HIPC increased. This reflects limitations in development finance not internal to the design or implementation of the HIPC Initiative. Official development assistance to Africa actually declined during the 1990s and recovered moderately in 2002 with greater flows to health and education. Nonetheless, there are some positive developments: some donor countries are taking steps to untie their aid, and in 2003 the heads of multilateral and bilateral development institutions and representatives of the International Monetary Fund, other multilateral financial institutions and partner countries adopted the Rome Declaration on Harmonization.[63] Those steps would help to increase aid flexibility and to simplify and harmonize programming, reporting and disbursement procedures. Some HIPC-eligible African countries benefited from debt reduction, while partner countries took steps to promote private investment in the region.

106. The United Nations system consolidated efforts to assist the least developed countries in a series of conferences convened especially to discuss issues and strategies central to the development of those countries. The most recent, the Third United Nations Conference on the Least Developed Countries, took place in 2001. Reflecting the central goal of poverty reduction in international development cooperation, the Programme of Action for the Least Developed Countries for the Decade 2001-2010 (A/CONF.191/11) has the overarching goal of halving the proportion of people living in extreme poverty by 2015, a Millennium Development Goal.

107. In 1996, the Singapore Ministerial Declaration focused the attention of the international community on granting special trade preferences for the least developed countries. In May 2000, the United States passed the African Growth and Opportunity Act, extending the range of products in its Generalized System of Preferences (GSP) scheme in favour of designated sub-Saharan African countries. In September of the same year, Canada also expanded the range of products covered in its GSP scheme. The product list was greatly enlarged in January 2003 to include all but a few selected agricultural products. In March 2001, the Everything but Arms (EBA) initiative by the European Union went into effect, providing duty-free and quota-free market access to non-arms exports except bananas, sugar and rice from least developed countries. Japan also undertook reviews of its GSP scheme in 2000 and 2003, adding products from least developed countries for duty-free treatment each time.

108. A recent UNCTAD study[64] found that in 2002, the initiatives covered 66 per cent of all least developed country effective beneficiaries, but only a fraction of the potential products actually received trade preference at the time of custom clearance. Furthermore, the utilization and benefits of the preferences concentrated on a few country/product pairs, while the overall picture remained dismal. The analysis in that report shows that strict rule of origin and related administrative procedures are the main reasons for low utilization. The requirements add costs to

least developed country exporters, narrowing the preference benefits. More importantly, some of the least developed countries may find themselves short of human and institutional capacity to meet the requirements, thus foregoing the potential benefits granted under the schemes.

109. The latest progress in World Trade Organization talks on agriculture, including agricultural support policies and access to markets of developed countries, revived hopes for progress on trade issues important to social development in Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean and other developing regions. Although, with respect to Africa and the least developed countries, the actual impact of an agricultural agreement in the Doha round remains to be seen, breaking the stalemate in negotiations would enable those countries to benefit from the Doha Development Agenda Trust Fund set up to assist African countries in their trade-related technical capacity-building.

C. Conclusion

110. The preceding analysis shows that developments in the 10 years after the World Summit for Social Development have had mixed effects on the creation of an enabling environment for social development. On the positive side, democratization and the increasingly important role of civil society organizations as partners for social development, despite the decline in the role of trade unions, helped to promote transparency and accountability. The economic environment for social development has also improved to the extent that market reforms and structural adjustment programmes have started to take into account the crucial role of social development in sustaining such reforms. However, the actual implementation of policy still lags behind. The institutional framework for policy-making at both the national and international levels needs to be strengthened to put into practice the integration of social and economic policies.

111. Asymmetries in the current globalization process, reflected in the unequal distribution of its benefits as well as in the unbalanced governance framework, have limited the potential positive impact of globalization on social development. In particular, national autonomy in the implementation of social and economic policies that promote such social development goals as poverty eradication and employment generation is being undermined. Challenges to creating a favourable national and international environment for social development include redressing those asymmetries of globalization and harmonizing international trade, finance and social regimes.

112. Financial resources for social development remain inadequate, although international initiatives such as the HIPC Initiative have started [illegible] shift the allocation of public finance towards social sectors in some countries. The unfulfilled promise of the post-cold war peace dividend, the failure of most development partners to meet the ODA target of 0.7 per cent of GNP and insufficient economic growth in many developing countries are among the major obstacles to overcome in order to increase financing for social development. The situation in Africa and the least developed countries is particularly distressing.

113. A novel and disturbing component of the international climate for social development has been the reappearance of security issues on the centre stage of national and international debate. As indicated in a recent report to the General

Assembly, a deteriorating security situation can have detrimental consequences for both disarmament and development.[65] Insecurity can lead to increased military spending. An insecure environment can also result in shrinking opportunities as investors and donors abandon unstable areas and local economic activities are curtailed.

114. An increased focus on combating international violence has diverted attention and human and financial resources away from development. Thus, there is a risk that concerns for national security will further marginalize the social agenda both nationally and internationally, especially in times of heightened public alert over security threats. That reality has compounded the difficulties for social development analysed in the present report and has prevented the emergence of comprehensive strategies, including building an enabling environment and strengthening institutions, as public attention has been diverted elsewhere.

IV. Observed trends in the three core issues and other commitments addressed by the World Summit for Social Development

115. At its twenty-fourth special session in 2000, during which the General Assembly adopted resolution S-24/2 on further initiatives for social development, the Secretary-General stated that events since the 1995 World Summit for Social Development had confirmed its central insight, understood in two closely related propositions: that economic growth, if it was to be broad-based and sustainable, required investment in people — their health, their education and their security; and secondly, that growth would not by itself guarantee that all people in a country had the chance to live lives of dignity and fulfilment. He also stated that no country could be called truly prosperous so long as many of its citizens were left to fend for themselves against ignorance, hardship and disease, and that if societies remained polarized along the lines of ethnicity, race or class and prone to outbursts of group hatred and violence, then no one could claim convincingly to be winning the battle against human misery.

116. Chapter III continues the inquiry into that battle by examining whether or not the world has progressed towards a society for all as envisioned at the Summit 10 years ago. The 10 Commitments continue to be examined through observed trends in poverty, employment and social integration as well as in gender equality and access to education and primary health care. A further look is taken at some of the factors behind the trends, which are likely to have greater resonance as the current dimensions of social development are outlined in the report.

A. Eradication of poverty
Commitment 2

117. The Copenhagen Declaration[1] and Programme of Action[2] emphasized the eradication of poverty through decisive national actions and international cooperation as an ethical, social, political and economic imperative of humankind. Countries committed themselves to the formulation of national policies and strategies to substantially reduce overall poverty, with specific time-bound

commitments to eradicate absolute poverty. Their commitment also included the call to increase opportunities and access to resources and income, to reduce inequalities and remove the constraints that engendered them, and to provide for basic needs for all.

118. The twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly called for placing poverty eradication at the centre of economic and social development and for building a consensus with all relevant actors on policies and strategies to reduce by one half the proportion of people living in extreme poverty by the year 2015. There was a focus on integrating policies at all levels, including economic and fiscal policies, capacity- and institution-building, and on giving priority to investments in education and health, social protection and basic social services. The twenty-fourth special session also encouraged Governments to develop and implement pro-poor sustainable growth policies that enhanced the potential and ability of people living in poverty to improve their lives.

119. The World Summit for Social Development policy framework on poverty was also present in subsequent conferences and summits. One illustration of the trend was the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995 and its follow-up, which addressed the links between absolute poverty and the feminization of poverty. The contributions of women were seen as key to combating poverty, as equality of rights strengthens women's opportunities to participate in productive activities. Building on the Summit and the Beijing Conference, Governments are reported to have recognized the broader definition of poverty, including a lack of access to resources, income and employment.

120. Commitment Two of the World Food Summit Plan of Action, of 1996, also sought to implement policies that would eradicate poverty, specifically to enable "farmers, fishers, foresters and other food producers, particularly women, to earn a fair return from their labour, capital and management".[66] It recognized the link between poverty, equality of conditions and food insecurity, stating that "sustainable progress in poverty eradication is critical to improve access to food".[67] It further emphasized that the elimination of trade barriers was key to achieving food security, thus calling for the reduction of developed countries' subsidies of food exports in order to eliminate barriers to the export competitiveness of farmers in poor countries.

121. At the International Conference on Financing for Development in Monterrey, Mexico, in 2002, the elimination of poverty and the improvement of social conditions worldwide were framed as systemic challenges that had to be approached from a broad perspective. The Conference also called for efforts to reinforce national capacity-building in areas that included social and gender budget policies,[68] echoing Commitment 8 of the Summit, which called on Governments, inter alia, to protect the poor and vulnerable from budget reductions while increasing the quality and effectiveness of social expenditures.

122. Later that same year, the World Summit on Sustainable Development in Johannesburg observed that poverty eradication and adequate management of the natural resource base that allowed for social development were overarching objectives of sustainable development. Recognizing that inequality remained within and between societies, the World Summit on Sustainable Development advocated the importance of promoting socially and culturally acceptable policies; equal and

equitable access to education, health-care services and economic opportunities; and initiatives that enabled economic and social empowerment.

123. Perhaps most importantly, the commitment to eradicate poverty adopted at the World Summit for Social Development was further embodied in the United Nations Millennium Declaration, which aimed to improve people's lives in the course of a generation and also resolved to halve, by 2015, the proportion of people living in extreme poverty and the proportion of people who suffered from hunger.

124. Since the Summit, Governments have also given increased priority to poverty reduction through setting national poverty reduction targets and formulating and implementing poverty eradication plans and strategies. Anti-poverty plans have focused on increased access to basic social services, including health and education, especially for vulnerable groups; promotion of employment opportunities; provision of social protection; and measures to address the adverse effects of financial crises.

125. Even if the limitations of analysing poverty only in monetary terms are kept in mind, progress has been uneven. The proportion of people living on less than the Millennium Development Goal measure of poverty dropped, at the global level, from around 30 per cent in 1990 to 21 per cent in 2001.[69] The largest reduction in extreme poverty was in China, where the number of extremely poor people fell from 384 million to 232 million between 1990 and 1999, or from 33 per cent to 18 per cent of the population. More recently, the transition economies of Eastern Europe and Central Asia have made a marked recovery, reversing the increase in poverty that occurred during the 1990s. Although most of Asia and North Africa remain broadly on track for meeting the Millennium Development Goal on poverty, little or no progress has been made in sub-Saharan Africa and in Latin America and the Caribbean, and in western Asia poverty has actually increased. As of 2001, almost half the population of sub-Saharan Africa, the same proportion as in 1990, was still surviving on one dollar or less a day.

126. Since the Summit, a lack of sustained pro-poor growth has been a major obstacle to reducing poverty. During the 1990s, out of 155 developing and transition countries with data available, only 30, or about one in five, achieved per capita income growth of more than 3 per cent a year; 71 had positive annual income growth of less than 3 per cent; and 54 experienced a fall in per capita income. Of the countries with declining incomes, 20 are from sub-Saharan Africa, 17 are from Eastern Europe and the Commonwealth of Independent States, 6 are from Latin America and the Caribbean, 6 are from East Asia and the Pacific and 5 are from the Arab States.[70]

127. As a result of low or uneven growth and an inequitable distribution of the benefits of growth, in 2000 more than 1.1 billion people worldwide were struggling to survive on less than one dollar a day and more than twice that number on less than two dollars a day — more than half of the population of the developing world. The number of poor people increased by 102 million in sub-Saharan Africa, Latin America and the Caribbean, Western Asia and Eastern Europe.[71]

128. Sharp regional disparities also exist, with some regions reaching new levels of development and others being left behind. Growth of GDP was particularly strong in East Asia and the Pacific, almost 140 per cent over the 10-year period, although it was partly reversed by the financial crisis of 1997. Between 1990 and 1999, the number of people living on less than one dollar a day in the region dropped by

approximately 226 million. The challenges are greatest in sub-Saharan Africa, which has had high rates of population growth and has made limited progress in reducing poverty. Although aggregate gross domestic product in the region increased by 29 per cent from 1990 to 1999, per capita domestic product did not change and the number of people living in extreme poverty increased by 74 million. Currently, more than 300 million people in sub-Saharan Africa are living on less than one dollar a day.[72] In South Asia, home to almost 500 million poor people, the total number of poor changed only slightly from 1990 to 1999.[73]

129. Since poverty is a multifaceted phenomenon, there are many factors behind the mixed results in moving towards poverty reduction, and many countries continue to face deep-seated obstacles and challenges for poverty reduction and eradication. Social, political and other factors impeding efforts in the area include, but are certainly not limited to, social exclusion and discrimination and the resultant lack of opportunities and political power, as well as the denial or lack of enforcement of legal rights; lack of access to basic education and health services; armed conflict; disease, especially HIV/AIDS; poor governance; the burden of geography, particularly for small and landlocked countries; and rapid population growth. Among the many economic factors that are obstacles to or that undermine poverty reduction are low or unevenly distributed economic growth, high unemployment, heavy external debt, trade system barriers, high levels of income inequality and commodity dependency.

130. Among those factors, civil conflict is of particular relevance to poverty eradication and economic growth in the least developed countries, which, as countries with very low income levels, are more at risk.[74] The overall incidence of extreme poverty for the group of least developed countries as a whole did not decline during the decade of the 1990s, and from 1990 to 2001, 60 per cent of those countries also experienced civil conflict of varying intensity and duration. That proportion represents a significant increase over the 40 per cent involved in civil strife during the period 1978-1989.[75]

131. HIV/AIDS is another major factor affecting poverty and, as mentioned in other sections of this report, has had a particularly devastating impact on sub-Saharan Africa, even reducing life expectancy from 50 years in 1990 to 46 years in 2002. The disease is most often contracted by adults in the prime of their life: the International Labour Organization estimates that at least 26 million workers aged 15 to 49, many of them primary breadwinners, are infected with the virus worldwide.

132. The magnitude of the consequences extend far beyond the disease itself, leaving behind millions of orphans and older persons who were already excluded from mainstream employment and social protection programmes. Deaths from HIV/AIDS often leave the surviving dependants in poverty and can negatively affect the educational development of the surviving children, making it much more difficult for them to either escape from or stay out of poverty later in life. Furthermore, many older persons find support and resources seriously depleted at the same time they are called on to help others, such as their orphaned grandchildren.

133. In the context of socio-economic policy-making, other major factors influencing poverty include the interrelationships between poverty and economic growth, inequality and trade liberalization. With respect to growth, there is general agreement that sustained economic growth is a desirable and necessary ally in

facilitating long-term, sustainable poverty eradication. It is also argued that sustained economic growth of a type that is broad and inclusive and that substantially increases average household income and consumption is more effective for poverty reduction than a form of economic growth in which expansion is localized within a geographic and/or sectoral enclave.[76] However, growth by itself is not sufficient, and even high growth rates alone do not guarantee poverty reduction or eradication.

134. The persistence of high levels of income inequality and its further rise in many countries have made it much more difficult to reduce poverty through growth. The evidence suggests that the higher the level of income inequality, the less impact economic growth has in reducing poverty for any rate of growth. While higher growth rates are likely to improve poverty reduction prospects in both high- and low-inequality countries, the high-inequality countries need to grow significantly — and often unrealistically — faster to achieve the same amount of poverty reduction.

135. In countries where income inequality is very high, wealthy people often control the political system and poor people are neglected, forestalling broad-based development. Governments may fail to invest adequately in health and education services for the poor. They may also neglect or exclude social groups, such as people of a particular race, ethnicity, religion or region, and they may exhibit biases towards the urban populations and away from the rural. In many countries, certain social groups receive fewer basic social services and face unequal opportunities, illustrating a strong link between social exclusion and poverty. Social exclusion and inequalities based on gender, especially in education and employment, are also serious problems increasing poverty. Therefore, policies that address inequalities, including those relating to the provision of services and access to them, legal rights, assets and income, are necessary and even crucial for combating poverty.

136. In addition to examining the effects of income inequality and other inequalities on poverty, the relationship between poverty eradication and trade liberalization has recently come under scrutiny from both international organizations and academia. The United Nations Conference on Trade and Development examined 66 least developed countries and their experience with trade liberalization during the selected five-year periods, from either 1990 to 1995 or from 1995 to 2000,[77] concluding that the relationship between trade liberalization and poverty reduction is neither automatic nor straightforward. That view is consistent with the conclusions of a similar review of academic studies, which also found that there is no simple general conclusion about the relationship between the two.[78]

137. Furthermore, UNCTAD found that the situation in which average private per capita consumption decreases at the same time that exports increase tends to occur more often in least developed countries with high levels of income inequality. It also found that there has been a tendency for the countries that have opened their economies to international trade more gradually and less deeply to have a better trade-poverty relationship than those that have opened the furthest the fastest on the one hand, and those that have remained the most restrictive on the other.

138. In general, the impact of trade liberalization depends on the starting point of a country engaging in the process, the precise trade reform measures taken, the identity of the poor and their means of sustaining themselves, and the environment in which it is carried out, including the policies that accompany it. Another consideration is that there is much evidence that poorer households may be not only

less able than richer ones to protect themselves against adverse effects from trade liberalization, but also less able to take advantage of the positive opportunities created by the reform. The evidence implies a possible stronger link between trade and poverty with respect to the adverse effects from liberalization but a weaker link with respect to the positive effects. A final consideration is that, although trade liberalization is not a direct or particularly powerful policy mechanism for addressing poverty, such trade liberalization measures as lowering tariffs and removing import quotas are changes that are relatively easy to implement and that, if done correctly, can still have some positive effects on reducing poverty.

139. Finally, other important dimensions of poverty, including social exclusion and access to education and health services will be presented below, in the context of a specific review of the commitments made at Copenhagen on these issues.

B. Expansion of productive employment and reduction of unemployment

Commitment 3

140. Progress in reaching the goal of full employment advocated during the Summit has fallen far short of expectations. Rather than making strides towards the attainment of freely chosen productive employment and work for all, the past 10 years have witnessed a rise in unemployment levels globally. An unprecedented 186 million people were unemployed in 2003, accounting for 6.2 per cent of the working population, up from 140 million a decade earlier. In addition, 550 million people fell among the ranks of the working poor.[79] Where job growth has taken place, it has been disproportionately concentrated in insecure, informal forms of employment with low wages and few benefits.

141. Although the overall picture is negative, employment performance has shown considerable variation across regions and economic groupings. Among developed countries as a whole, unemployment rates declined by 1.2 percentage points over the decade, in contrast to much of the developing world, which experienced rising unemployment rates, ranging from an increase of 0.9 percentage points in East Asia to 2.1 percentage points in Latin America and the Caribbean, 2.4 percentage points in South-East Asia and 2.9 percentage points for the economies in transition of Central and Eastern Europe. On a more positive note, unemployment rates held steady in South Asia and in the Middle East and North Africa over the decade and even declined by 0.2 percentage points in sub-Saharan Africa.

142. Nevertheless, unemployment rates tell only part of the story, as they give no indication of the quality of jobs and whether those jobs provide secure and sustainable livelihoods. A better indicator of job quality is the share of employment in the informal economy. Although the informal economy is a heterogeneous phenomenon and conditions vary greatly, participation in the informal economy, by definition, means a lack of social protection, a lack of protection by labour laws, low job security, an unstable source of income and no pension fund payments after retirement. The size of the informal economy has been growing worldwide, particularly in developing regions with low economic growth rates. The share of the informal economy in the non-agricultural workforce ranges from 55 per cent in Latin America to between 45 and 85 per cent in Asia, reaching nearly 80 per cent in Africa.[80] Those trends show no sign of reversing, as recent estimates from the

International Labour Organization indicate that over 90 per cent of new jobs in Africa are in the informal sector.[81]

143. Increasing participation in the insecure informal economy, particularly by vulnerable and disadvantaged groups who have limited opportunities for employment elsewhere, has contributed to increasing inequalities between different groups in terms of wages, security and social protection. The proliferation of informal employment also explains the growing incidence of those working but remaining poor, particularly in such regions as South Asia and sub-Saharan Africa, where 40 per cent and 45 per cent respectively of those employed were counted among the working poor.[82]

144. The employment situation has been particularly difficult for women and youth, as those groups have suffered disproportionately high rates of unemployment and underemployment. They are more likely to find themselves struggling to make a living in the growing informal sector, working long hours and accepting low pay and working conditions that other workers find unacceptable. The situation arises not only from their lower levels of education and work experience, but also from frequent discrimination against them in the labour market, both in hiring and in gaining access to credit to begin their own microenterprises. Furthermore, young workers and women tend to be the last hired and the first fired during business cycles.

145. Of all age groups, the increase in unemployment rates was the most pronounced for youth aged 15 to 24. World youth unemployment jumped from 10 per cent, or 70 million young people in 1995, to 14.4 per cent, or over 88 million, by 2003. Although youth comprise just 25 per cent of the working age population between 15 and 64 years, they account for nearly 47 per cent of the 186 million people unemployed worldwide.[83] As a consequence, youth unemployment is typically two to three times higher than for others. Young women are especially at risk, as they experience unemployment rates 20 to 50 per cent higher than that of young men.

146. To help counter the problems of youth unemployment, the Secretary-General established the Youth Employment Network, an inter-agency initiative of the United Nations, the International Labour Organization and the World Bank, first proposed in a report entitled "We the peoples: the role of the United Nations in the twenty-first century" (A/54/2000). The 12-member High-Level Panel of the Youth Employment Network was appointed to propose recommendations on youth employment policy, encompassing four areas of policy intervention: employment creation, employability, entrepreneurship and equal opportunities. Ten countries have so far committed to taking the lead in the preparation and implementation of national action plans for youth employment.

147. The employment situation of women has shown both progress and stagnation over the decade. Positive signs include the record number of women participating in the labour market, with 200 million more women employed in 2003 than a decade earlier. Owing to those increases, 40 per cent of the world's 2.8 billion workers are now women. Nevertheless, women, like other disadvantaged groups, tend to be concentrated in more precarious forms of employment that offer low wages and little job security. Not only do women continue to have higher unemployment rates and lower wage rates than men, they also represent 60 per cent of the world's 550 million working poor.[84]

148. The factors that shape such discouraging trends in employment vary across regions and economic groupings. Those that appear to stand out include globalization, competitive pressures and national policy decisions.

1. Globalization

149. Globalization and the integration of economies have had major impacts — both positive and negative — on employment, poverty and inequality. As the International Labour Organization observed recently, jobs, incomes, security and the rights of workers are heavily affected by such things as patterns of international investment, the growth of trade and the cross-border movement of workers.[85] Given the interrelationships and interdependencies of the global economy, it is increasingly difficult for countries to achieve employment goals on their own.

150. The point is highlighted by the effects of the various financial and economic crises that have gripped parts of the world over the last decade. The Asian financial crisis in 1997 produced massive job losses in the countries immediately affected as well as throughout the region. Other crises, such as the crisis in the Russian Federation and the Latin American debt crisis also had global effects. Job losses were felt most profoundly in countries that lacked adequate systems of social protection, leaving laid-off workers to fend for themselves without any financial assistance from the Government to tide them over until they secured new employment.

151. Closely tied to the erosion of labour standards is the decline in the volume and influence of trade unions. With the increased mobility of both capital and labour, combined with high unemployment rates and a shrinking share of workers covered by collective bargaining agreements, workers generally have less bargaining power in negotiations with employers. This situation has led to concession bargaining, where workers are willing to accept cutbacks in wages, benefits and working conditions in exchange for keeping their jobs. Although there have been some positive signs as well, such as the increase in the number of transnational labour agreements with multinational enterprises, the balance of power largely rests on the side of employers.

152. For countries fortunate enough to partake fully in the information and communication technology revolution, opportunities for job growth and development have been numerous. With everything from computer call centres, to hotel reservation systems, to data-processing centres plugged into the global network, companies have been able to relocate jobs to lower-cost overseas labour markets with increasing ease. Unfortunately, however, not all countries have been in a position to take advantage of the information and communication technology revolution. Owing to a lack of Internet access caused by insufficient availability of cable networks or simply by not enough workers skilled in computer and other technologies, certain regions, sub-Saharan Africa chief among them, are at a further competitive disadvantage in the global marketplace. In short, despite the potential for the emergence of a global knowledge-based information society, some aspects of the digital revolution have actually produced a "digital divide" resulting in the majority of the world remaining isolated, within and between countries and increasing the socio-economic gap between social groups and among countries and regions.[86]

153. Globalization and the integration of economies has also meant that people — not just jobs and capital — are moving across borders with increasing volume and frequency. Growing numbers of workers are moving from developing countries to industrialized countries in search of jobs and better economic opportunities. According to the International Labour Organization, close to half of all migrants and refugees worldwide, or some 86 million adults, are economically active, employed or otherwise engaged in remunerated activities.[87] Despite the large — and ever-growing — numbers of international migrants, no multilateral framework exists for governing the cross-border movement of people, opening the process to abuse and exploitation of vulnerable workers. However, significant progress towards that end was made at the June 2004 session of the International Labour Conference, where a plan of action was adopted calling for the development of a non-binding multilateral framework for a rights-based approach to labour migration.

2. Competitive pressures

154. The drive to become ever more competitive in the international economy has created pressure among companies to contain labour costs, with the resultant action engendering feelings of insecurity and instability among workers worldwide. Increased competition for foreign direct investment and export markets have led to a push for a reduction in real wages and benefits, added labour market flexibility, and an erosion of labour protections and conditions of work. All too often, firms opt to pursue a path to competition that is based on lower wages and little attention to labour standards, as opposed to one that places emphasis on increasing productivity through the maintenance of higher wages and decent working conditions.

155. In developed market economies, industry has engaged in a process of shifting out of non-competitive ventures into more lucrative and competitive ones. All of this economic restructuring has necessarily led to labour market adjustments, including mass layoffs and downsizing in the non-competitive sectors, which in part explains the striking rise in wage inequality in the industrialized countries.[85] In addition, a growing number of firms are shifting their production from high-wage industrialized countries to low-wage developing countries — and then on to even lower-wage countries. Although the movement of jobs from developed to developing countries has been occurring for decades, what is new is the type of industry affected. In the past, the textile and garment industries were heavily impacted by outsourcing from the North to the South, but today it is jobs in the information and telecommunication industry — data processors, computer programmers and the like — whose jobs are moving overseas. The affected workers need income support, retraining and job search assistance to help them make the transition into new occupations.

156. Economic restructuring and competitive pressures have also created a need for greater mobility and adaptability in the labour market, including a demand for more skilled jobs, as well as more flexible forms of employment. The focus on "just-in-time" and demand-driven production in industrialized countries has led to a growth in part-time, temporary, seasonal, contract and other flexible, yet more precarious, forms of employment contracts, enabling companies to add or shed workers with relative ease but deepening labour insecurity. In effect, part-time jobs have accounted for half or more of total employment growth over the past decade in half of the OECD countries.[88] Although such contingent employment arrangements may enable companies to adapt more readily to changing demands in the market, they

can be destabilizing for workers who can no longer count on the security of a steady job with a regular pay check.

157. Export processing zones, specially designated localities intended to facilitate international trade, are yet another indication of how competitive pressures have impacted employment and working conditions. In recent years, the zones have sprung up around the globe, employing over 50 million workers worldwide, of whom many are young women in developing countries. As an enticement to investment in the zones, companies are sometimes given exemptions from national labour laws. Consequently, employees working in the zones typically face serious legal and other obstacles to exercising their labour rights, including the right to form and join free and independent labour unions. Although wages are frequently above market inside the zones, the absence of labour protections means that workers can be subject to exploitation and abuse.

158. Efforts to increase competitiveness have been closely associated with the preference for a market-based approach and the belief that the unhindered workings of the market would be sufficient to stimulate job growth and development. Experience has shown, however, that it is not enough to rely solely on growth. Active policies are also needed to promote the efficient functioning of markets and to spur employment, placing employment creation at the centre of economic policy-making.

159. In concert with market-driven policies, there has been a shift in power from public to private institutions and a contraction of the welfare state in many countries. The result has been a weakening of social protection systems, privatization of public services and major downsizings of the public workforce. Economies in transition have felt the changes in a dramatic fashion following the fall of the Soviet Union, where workers lost pensions, health insurance and other benefits previously provided by the State. Developing countries undergoing structural adjustment also suffered major cutbacks in publicly provided jobs and benefits. In general, the International Labour Organization reports that 80 per cent of the world's families have little or no social protection.

160. As part of the overall preference for the market, policy makers have also sought to privatize public services. Privatization is generally associated with improved efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of products and services, although the evidence and experience in the privatization of public services have been mixed, to say the least. A frequent by-product of the approach, as evidenced by the recent privatization of State-owned enterprises in China and in the economies of the former Soviet Union, is large-scale layoffs and dislocations. In China, 27.8 million workers were laid off from State-owned enterprises between 1998 and 2003, with 18.5 million of them re-employed.[89] In addition, public works projects, which have traditionally been an important source of new jobs for vulnerable workers, have also been strongly curtailed.

161. An important weakness of pursuing efficiency gains through privatization and a strict market-based approach is that it overlooks the connection between healthy and secure workers and a more productive workforce. Workers that are constantly worrying about their future (owing to the lack of a pension scheme) or about their health (owing to the lack of health insurance coverage or access to affordable health services) or about the security of their jobs (owing to the constant threat of layoffs) can feel demoralized and discouraged, which can lead to lower productivity. The

link between the creation of jobs and productivity growth and the development of an efficient, equitable labour market, economic stability and sustained economic growth needs to be reaffirmed.

3. National policies

162. In addition to international factors, it is also important to recognize the impact of national policies and programmes regarding employment and labour. One key factor is that national labour legislation has not kept pace with changes in employment patterns, such as the rising use of contract labour and the expansion of informal employment. As a result, many workers fall outside the protection of labour laws, contributing to the overall decline in labour standards. A related problem is that many countries lack adequately functioning systems and institutions for social dialogue as well as representative organizations of workers and employers. Without the means to prevent and resolve labour conflicts peacefully, serious threats to social stability can arise, which can also discourage foreign investment and, with it, further employment promotion.

163. Given the level of job changes and dislocations inherent in today's dynamic labour market, active labour market policies are essential to fostering the smooth reallocation of labour from declining industries into new and emerging ones. However, national policies are often not in place to facilitate job search assistance, training and the upgrading of skills to help dislocated workers' transition into new jobs. In addition, without sufficient investment in education and training, countries cannot be assured of a skilled, adaptable workforce prepared to compete in a knowledge-based economy. In the absence of adequate protection, including unemployment insurance or other forms of income support, workers, particularly those from more vulnerable groups, could suffer serious hardship during periods of unemployment and transition.

164. In order to deal effectively with the various challenges confronting the labour market, policy makers should be well equipped to develop and implement active labour market policies at the national level. However, in part as a result of the structural adjustment policies mentioned above, ministries of labour have suffered deep cuts in their staffs and budgets, resulting in a diminished capacity to carry out their responsibilities in research, policy development and implementation of labour-market policies. Furthermore, they have been marginalized from the process of economic policy-making, hampering the ability of many countries to successfully integrate labour-market policies within the macroeconomic framework. Little can be done to fix employment-related problems if the entities ascribed to do the fixing are in need of help themselves.

C. Social integration

Commitment 4

165. The Summit recognized that social integration was an important determinant of, and significantly affected by, poverty and unemployment and that combating those ills was essential. It further viewed the failures of social integration to include social fragmentation; widening disparities and inequalities; and strains on individuals, families, communities and institutions as a result of the rapid pace of

social change, economic transformation, migration and major dislocations of population, particularly in areas of armed conflict.[90]

166. As stated in the Copenhagen Declaration and further underscored in the five-year review of implementation of the Summit, promoting respect for democracy, the rule of law, diversity and solidarity and removing institutionalized inequalities are critical to successful social integration. To that end, national Governments and their development partners have utilized the educational systems and the various media to advance an understanding of the multiple facets of social integration and to promote tolerance in their societies. Participation by all, including civil society organizations, in policy formulation, implementation and monitoring requires responsive and accessible Government as well as capacity of and opportunity for all, especially the vulnerable and groups with special needs. Equity, social justice and equality of access and opportunity, for both basic services and work, are important concepts to promote social integration.

167. As emphasized at the Summit, non-discrimination, tolerance, mutual respect and diversity form the starting point for social integration. In the 10 years since the Summit, 13 countries have become parties to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, bringing the total to 146. In 1995, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights also added 21 new States parties to the existing 131. Twenty-three additional countries have joined the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination since 1995, raising the total to 169. In 1995, 43 countries joined the existing 93 to become parties to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. Twenty-five countries, including 19 since 1995, have ratified the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, although none of the labour-importing countries have done so.

168. The Summit's approach to social integration has been echoed in other international conferences. The United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II), held in Istanbul in 1996, also emphasized the negative impacts on society when consideration of the principles of equity and social integration are ignored, addressing in detail the concerns expressed by the World Summit for Social Development about homelessness and the provision of adequate housing. The rising global trend of rural to urban migration, often related to the search for employment opportunities, has clearly resulted in an increased demand for urban housing. Lack of affordable housing and the lack of means to pay for housing by the poor and unemployed have resulted in unhealthy and unsafe living conditions and a rise in slum dwellings, contributing to environmental degradation. Those conditions often lead to social disintegration, including intolerance and violence. Habitat II adopted as one of its major goals the provision of adequate shelter for all and called for human settlements that provided adequate infrastructure, public services and employment opportunities more equitably to rural areas, as an integral part of strategies to respond to rural-to-urban migration.

169. Similarly, the Summit guided the development of the conceptual framework for a society for all ages, the unifying theme of the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing.[91] Viewed as the fundamental aim of social integration, the inclusion of older persons in poverty reduction strategies and participatory processes in the design of poverty eradication programmes became a fundamental

aim of the Madrid Plan of Action. By integrating "age" into the Summit's view of a society for all, the approach also became multigenerational, whereby generations "invest in one another and share in the fruits of that investment, guided by the twin principles of reciprocity and equity".[92]

170. Notwithstanding those developments, solidarity — a key principle recognized by the Summit as forming part of the foundation for action in social development — has eroded in the ten years after the Summit. The movement to reform social protection out of a motivation for efficiency and financial viability, driven by a more market-oriented approach, continues to undermine social solidarity in many countries. In some industrialized countries, a key feature of social protection reforms has been to raise eligibility standards for social assistance combined with some form of reduction of benefits. Even in traditionally strong welfare states, the trend is to move towards reform measures that effectively reduce welfare benefits. Measures have been implemented to privatize certain social insurance schemes such as pension and medical plans. In developing countries undergoing macroeconomic reform, social protection has been sacrificed to meet budget performance conditionalities, either as reductions in existing programmes or, perhaps less obviously, as delays in implementing or expanding social protection programmes.

171. While the Summit reaffirmed the importance of solidarity in society in general, it also expressed the role of solidarity as a micro-foundation of society. Thus, the Summit recognized that the family is the basic unit of society, which was reaffirmed by the twenty-fourth special session, adding that the family plays a key role in social development and is a strong force for social cohesion and integration. However, demographic, socio-economic and cultural forces have redefined traditional notions and structures of families and have engendered changes in family roles. Migration and urbanization, the increased participation of women in the workforce, the substantial increase projected in the world's older population and the spread of HIV/AIDS have brought about salient and unprecedented changes in family forms and household compositions.

172. The Summit also called for the protection and full integration of disadvantaged and vulnerable groups and persons into the economy and society. Disadvantaged groups mentioned in the Copenhagen Declaration include older persons, persons with disabilities, youth, migrants and indigenous peoples. As a whole, there is a shortage of comprehensive and systematic national plans to address the issues and concerns important to those groups. Nonetheless, much attention and momentum have been generated in the past decade in individual areas supported by different groups.

173. The Second World Assembly on Ageing was unique among United Nations conferences in that it explicitly reaffirmed the principle of social integration agreed upon at the Summit. The interaction between social, economic and environmental policies as stated in the 10 Commitments of the Summit became a core issue at the Assembly in Madrid, which stated that sustained legitimacy of development "requires the introduction and maintenance of policies that ensure the equitable distribution of the benefits of economic growth".[93]

174. The basic idea behind a "society for all ages", emphasized in the Madrid International Plan of Action on Ageing, is that all age groups are equally worthy and that equality of opportunity and equity in the distribution of the benefits of social and economic development should be ensured across generations. To achieve that

goal, policies are required that will not only strengthen individual development into late life but also create enabling environments including families, neighbourhoods, communities of interest and broad societal institutions based on principles of reciprocity and interdependence between generations.

175. In the area of disability, in its resolution 56/168 the General Assembly decided to establish an ad hoc committee "to consider proposals for a comprehensive and integral international convention to promote and protect the rights and dignity of persons with disabilities, based on the holistic approach of work done in the fields of social development, human rights and non-discrimination and taking into account the recommendations of the Commission on Human Rights and the Commission for Social Development". The Working Group of the Ad Hoc Committee on a Comprehensive and Integral International Convention on Protection and Promotion of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, with representation from Governments, non-governmental organizations and national human rights institutions, met in January 2004 and presented a draft as a basis for negotiations by member States and observers in the Ad Hoc Committee. The Ad Hoc Committee negotiated on the draft text during its third and fourth sessions, 24 May-4 June 2004 and 23 August-3 September respectively, and recommended that its fifth session be held in New York in January 2005.

176. In addition, the Standard Rules on the Equalization of Opportunities for Persons with Disabilities provide for the appointment of a special rapporteur to monitor the implementation of the Standard Rules. The Special Rapporteur on disability reports yearly to the Commission for Social Development, presenting findings on the promotion and monitoring of the implementation of the Standard Rules as well as recommendations, as requested by the Commission, on their further development. Concerning the proposal for a supplement to the Standard Rules, the Economic and Social Council recommended in its resolution E/2004/15 that the General Assembly consider the matter at its fifty-ninth session.

177. Indigenous peoples around the world have sought recognition of their identities, their ways of life and their right to traditional lands and resources, yet they have been marginalized and discriminated against throughout history. In April 2000, the Commission on Human Rights, by its resolution 2000/87, recommended to the Economic and Social Council the establishment of the Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues during the International Decade of the World's Indigenous Peoples (1995-2004). The Permanent Forum is now an advisory body to the Economic and Social Council with a mandate to discuss indigenous issues related to economic and social development, culture, the environment, education, health and human rights.

178. Even as progress is surveyed in implementing the Copenhagen Declaration's commitment to social integration, horrific and tragic events including ethnic cleansing, genocide and armed conflict continue to take place as the world strives to promote respect for human rights and tolerance. Those events are disturbing, particularly in a global environment where world leaders and Governments have committed themselves to the ideal of a society for all with equity and social justice at its foundation. The task of implementing commitments, educating the public and society and genuinely respecting rights, the rule of law and diversity remains daunting.

179. Trends and developments discussed throughout the present report, including market-based reforms and the growing interdependence of economies, all play a role in the broad range of issues that affect social integration. Additional factors that have a bearing on processes of social integration include inequalities, participation and migration.

1. Inequalities

180. The problems associated with inequality and disadvantage impact further on the more vulnerable segments of the population, but not all disadvantages are associated with income. Programmes that place people in categories have the potential to reinforce segmentation. Dominant groups, which can be embedded in public and private institutions, define the parameters of social membership. Those groups can impede social integration by restricting the access of outsiders on the basis of such culture-based affiliations, as ethnicity, race or religion. A common characteristic of those group distinctions is inequality, which has its clearest expression when democratic citizenship and participation are not allowed to prevail.

181. Inequality also has an intergenerational dimension, which for many begins early as a matter of inheritance. In some parts of the world, the distribution of education is extremely uneven and is determined by an individual's socio-economic characteristics, wealth and family origin. Educational opportunities — and, consequently, opportunities for access to productive employment — are to a degree inherited, thus excluding some of the population from equal access and opportunities.

182. Although in most cases attention is drawn to the need to establish and expand opportunities and access along with stated intentions to include the poor in governance issues, the mechanisms for those processes to take place are undeveloped and few resources are available for targeting the poor and marginalized. Consequently, the availability of domestic resources to provide for vital public services is restricted. In the least developed countries during the period 1995 to 1999, an average of 15 cents per person per day (compared to an average of 35 cents for other developing countries) were spent on private capital formation, public investment in infrastructure and the running of such vital public services as health, education and administration, as well as law and order.[94] Situations prevail where, even though about a third of the national budget, on average, is devoted to education and health, very little is actually spent on the poor. For example, according to World Bank estimates, the richest fifth receives four times the amount of education spending on the poorest fifth in certain countries, while in others, the richest fifth receives three times the curative health-care subsidy of the poorest.[95]

183. While income inequality exists everywhere in varying degrees, in areas of high inequality the poor are systematically left out; their exclusion can impede social progress and endanger social and political stability. However, just as wealth does not ensure peace, poverty alone does not cause conflict. Nevertheless, poverty and inequality together can make a major contribution to higher crime rates and higher risks of social tensions that lead to exclusion and the erosion of property rights and, ultimately, to conflict. In extreme cases, poverty and inequality can undermine the basic mechanisms of governance and lead to political disintegration. Armed conflicts are on the rise worldwide, and a growing number of least developed

countries have experienced disruptive civil wars and armed conflicts since the 1990s.

2. Participation

184. The perception of "being left out" is a consistent theme that emerges from participatory research. As mentioned above, even though the world has more democratic countries than ever before, global progress on political freedom has waned, and some countries are sliding back into authoritarianism. That affects the ability to participate and engage in political processes, an issue that extends beyond voting and relates to rights of citizenship and equality of access and opportunity. Individuals and groups who participate are likely to have more political influence than those who do not. Equally significant, moreover, is the cost to society when the absence of citizen involvement leads to a freer hand by political institutions to operate without public scrutiny.

185. In addition to political environments, conditions that tend to marginalize and exclude persons from participation in mainstream socio-economic activities, such as employment and social protection programmes, increase the number of disadvantaged groups. High levels of unemployment contribute to exclusion and the deterioration of living conditions for many, and long-term unemployment is particularly serious when it results in additional problems, such as greater personal indebtedness, drug abuse or family dissolution. Greater difficulty in finding work results in greater social isolation; it erodes skills and confidence, making it even more difficult to reintegrate into the workforce. In addition, the demand for mastery of new skills in the expansion of the digital economy is likely to aggravate the division between those who are integrated in and those who are excluded from the information and communication technology revolution.

186. Participation is central to development processes and is essential for their success and sustainability. It is frequently overlooked, however, which is why marginalization in poverty processes has become a global issue and a factor in the broad re-evaluation of poverty reduction strategies. In fact, policy prescriptions are still developed without adequate analysis of the impact that they will have on the poor. As a result the poorest and most vulnerable in many countries still find themselves excluded from concrete actions designed to alleviate their plight.

187. In some countries, stakeholders have found success in advocating for an increase in the share of public resources allocated to social development, such as in post-conflict areas with particularly acute needs relating to resettlement and displaced populations. In others, poverty reduction programmes may suffer from an urban bias, despite the concentration of poverty in rural regions; and in still others, governance problems are too entrenched to be influenced through poverty debates. However, even in countries where poverty programmes have been developed through widespread consultations, the issues identified in consultations are not necessarily linked to budget mechanisms, and the final poverty programmes may fail to target the poorest.

3. Migration

188. Increasing interdependence of economies coupled with continued income disparities among countries and cheaper and more accessible means of transport have all played a role in propelling international migration. By 2000, 175 million

persons were living outside their country of birth, making one in every 35 persons in the world an international migrant. The reality of migration is frequently distorted, however, despite its growing social and economic impact. Half-truths and stereotypes guide most citizens' views of migrants, fuelling perceptions of migration and migrants as a social problem. Those perceptions create a willingness to act on irrational fears and a situation whereby elements of xenophobia and racism that may have existed under the surface rise and become more prominent. Such views can become a driving force that can greatly influence other processes, including political processes.

189. Nonetheless, for migrants the process of integration into the host society is remarkably diversified. Immigrants may be legally included but socially excluded in some countries, mainly because their limited use of the language and knowledge of local customs cause them to be rejected by employers. In contrast, illegal immigrants in other countries may be legally excluded but the informal sector provides a means for them to be socially included. In countries that consider migration from a labour-importing perspective, migrants are considered temporary residents and are therefore not encouraged to integrate. If their temporary legal status erodes into illegal status, it exacerbates their exclusion and creates social inequities and ethnic stratification.

190. Emigration of younger members of rural families can cause exclusion among those left behind and, conversely, among non-migrating families who feel resentment and envy towards the visible signs of affluence brought on by remittance practices.

D. Gender equality
Commitment 5

191. The Copenhagen Declaration explicitly recognizes that "social justice" and "equitable social development" are essential to a sustainable development process. It further emphasizes that the "full participation of women and that equality and equity between women and men is a priority for the international community and as such must be at the centre of economic and social development".[96] That vision of the development process implies that it is not acceptable to exclude women from equal opportunities, conditions and treatment before the law.

192. Therefore, issues of gender equality and women's participation in society are integral to the general promotion of social participation and the goal of building a "society for all". In this regard, Member States pledged, in Commitment 5 of the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development, to promote full respect for human dignity, to achieve gender equity and equality and to enhance women's participation and leadership role in political, economic, civil and cultural life. National and international policies and programmes aimed at achieving equity and equality between women and men received renewed support at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing in 1995 and in its follow-up process, reflected in the increased attention given to the role of women in development, peacebuilding and conflict resolution and in the emphasis placed on empowering women through education and political and economic participation in development strategies and programmes.

193. One tangible indicator of concerted national and international efforts to remove institutionalized inequality between women and men is the increase in the

number of countries that are party to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women.[97] Since the convening of the World Summit for Social Development and the Fourth World Conference on Women in 1995, 27 additional countries have become party to the Convention. During the same period, 118 countries, 2 observers and 5 interregional, regional and subregional organizations have submitted plans of action in response to the Beijing Platform for Action.[98]

194. However, promoting gender equality requires more than the legal recognition of women's rights. It also calls for changes in attitudes and, sometimes, in traditions and social norms, which are often more critical to the implementation of policies and programmes that promote and enhance women's equal participation in all aspects of society. Although national Governments, civil society and international organizations have pursued strategies to enhance education in this area, progress has been uneven across the countries and regions of the world, and further actions are necessary to implement fully the programmes of action resulting from the Summit and the Fourth World Conference on Women in order to achieve equality between the sexes.

195. Enhancing women's participation in political life is one means to empower women. Women's participation as holders of political office is one indication of gender equality in political power and decision-making. In 2003, women held only 15 per cent of national parliamentary seats worldwide, representing an increase of slightly less than 2 percentage points over 1990. In the various regions [illegible] the world, only the Nordic countries reached a level of women's political representation close to parity, at 40 per cent in 2003, more than double the average for all developed countries. In the developing countries, substantial progress has been made in most regions with low levels of women's representation in 1990, although the actual level remains far below the goal of gender parity. In the countries with economies in transition, women's political participation declined, in part as a result of the dramatic political and economic changes that took place in those societies, although a reversal of the decline has been observed more recently. Western Asia and Oceania remain regions with very low representation of women in political life.[99]

196. Another means to empower women is through education. Based on United Nations data on enrolment, in the developed countries the gender ratio at the primary level remained stable at about 95 girls per 100 boys from 1990/91 to 2000/01. That ratio is considered parity given the greater number of boys in the population of that age group. While the rate increased in developing countries as a whole, from 83 to 87 over the same period, progress in the developing regions appears insufficient to meet the Millennium Development Goal target of eliminating gender disparity at all levels of education by 2015.

197. Furthermore, the situation of women and progress towards the target diverge significantly across geographical regions among developing countries. Latin America and the Caribbean, South-Eastern Asia and Eastern Asia have approached a gender parity in primary school enrolment close to that of the developed regions. The ratio in sub-Saharan Africa improved by 5 percentage points, but at 87 girls per 100 boys the rate needs to be increased further to meet the Millennium Development Goal target. The number of girls enrolled per 100 boys increased from 72 in 1990/91 to 79 by 2000/01 in Southern Asia. Despite the improvement, that region still has the greatest gender gap in the world.

198. For the developed countries, the gender ratio at the secondary level is about 98 girls per 100 boys. The developing countries as a group increased the rate from 72 to 82 from 1990 to 1998. Regional divergence is more pronounced at the secondary level than at the primary level. In Latin America and the Caribbean, more girls enrolled than boys, with a rate of 106 girls per 100 boys. However, the gender gap remains large in Western Asia and Southern Asia, with ratios of 74 and 68 respectively.

199. Over the same period, a large gender gap in enrolment at the tertiary level remains in developing countries, especially in Eastern and Southern Asia, sub-Saharan Africa and Oceania. In South-Eastern Asia and Western Asia, far more women than men (for a ratio of about 110) enrolled in tertiary educational institutions in 1998, on a par with the developed regions. For Western Asia, this contrasts sharply with women's underrepresentation at the secondary level. Latin America and the Caribbean also increased the female-male ratio to over 100 by 1998.

200. The global women's literacy rate increased from 80 per cent in 1990 to 83 per cent in 2000. Despite progress in reducing the gender gap in literacy in Africa, Southern Asia and Western Asia, there are still far more illiterate female young adults (ages 15-24) in the developing world, especially in the least developed countries and the landlocked countries, than illiterate young men. In fact, Africa, Southern Asia and Western Asia still have a gender gap of at least 10 percentage points in literacy rates. The exception is Latin America and the Caribbean, where the gender gap in literacy has been closed, as in the developed regions.

201. Participation in the economy is another key indicator of women's empowerment, and the progress in this area has been negligible: the share of women in paid non-agricultural employment worldwide increased from 34 per cent in 1990 to 35.7 per cent in 2001. Transition economies, with their historically high female labour market participation rates of almost 49 per cent, lead the world in gender equality in wage employment outside agriculture. In contrast, not only do the countries of the Middle East and Northern Africa have the world's lowest female participation in paid non-agricultural employment, but there is a downward trend, with the women's share declining steadily from 25 per cent in 1990 to 21 by 2001. Sub-Saharan Africa improved employment opportunities for women over the period 1990-2001 by increasing women's share in non-agricultural wage employment from 19 per cent to about 29. Latin America and the Caribbean still registered higher in closing the gender gap in employment, trailing by less than 2 percentage points behind the developed countries, where the ratio was 44 per cent in 2001.

202. Indicators in the various aspects of gender equality and women's empowerment show that a gap exists between the commitment to legal equal rights for women and actual implementation of policies and measures to ensure the realization of such rights. The overall slow progress in raising female participation in political and economic life and the possibility of failing to reach internationally agreed goals in gender equality if current trends continue clash sharply with commitments made at the Summit, at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing and in the Millennium Declaration. Closing the "implementation gap" will require persistent actions at both the national and international levels. The relative success at narrowing the gender gap in primary education to approach gender parity

in some regions of the developing world could serve as both an inspiration and a source of valuable lessons in meeting the challenge.

E. Universal access to education and primary health care Commitment 6

203. The Copenhagen Declaration, under Commitment 6, called for the promotion and attainment of the goals of universal and equitable access to quality education and the access of all to primary health care. These objectives were given prominence and renewed momentum by the Millennium Development Goals. Goal two of the Millennium Development Goals, achieving universal primary education, as well as Goal four (reducing child mortality), Goal five (improving maternal health) and Goal six (combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases), are all strongly linked to Commitment 6. Therefore, the main ideas behind this Commitment can be judged to have been — and to continue to be — a powerful influence in the current approach to development.

204. However, what will determine the ultimate success of the Commitment is whether the desired results are achieved. In addition to focusing on the two principal ideas of universal and equitable access to basic education and primary health care, it is important not to lose sight of the ideals embodied in the Commitment. Those include the general values of equity of access and the elimination of and rectification of inequalities with respect to social conditions, the importance of culture and a people-centred approach to development, and the full development of human resources.

1. Education

205. Consistent with the specific goal of universal and equitable access to quality education, Commitment 6 of the Copenhagen Declaration placed a strong emphasis on the universalization of basic education and the eradication of illiteracy. The further initiatives of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly continued to emphasize that commitment by their reaffirmation of the Dakar Framework for Action: Education for All: Meeting Our Collective Commitments.[100] The Dakar Framework for Action promoted the target, later incorporated into the Millennium Development Goal of achieving universal primary education, of ensuring that by 2015 all children, boys and girls alike, would be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.

206. An analysis of the extent to which universal and equitable access to quality education has been attained must include an examination of the Millennium Development Goal indicators of net enrolment ratios in primary education, the proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach grade 5 and the related literacy rate indicator of 15 to 24 year-olds. The net enrolment ratios can be viewed as a reflection of the issue of universality of access, the proportion reaching grade 5 is a measure of primary school completion and the literacy rate partially reflects the issue of school quality and the actual eradication of illiteracy. With respect to the net enrolment ratio of primary education, developing country regions on track to achieve the target before 2015 are Northern Africa, Latin America, the Caribbean, Eastern Asia, Central Asia and the Pacific.[101] However, lower levels of achievement and progress persist in sub-Saharan Africa, Western Asia and Southern Asia. With

respect to gender, some improvements in the gender differentials in enrolment rates were made in nearly all regions, as observed in the section on gender equality.

207. While enrolment trends are important, it is not sufficient to examine those trends alone. Some countries have high initial enrolment rates but low completion rates, where students begin school but do not stay in school long enough to receive a basic primary education. Therefore, in order to track progress in ensuring completion of a full course of primary education, completion rates must also be examined. The indicator used is the "survival rate" (i.e., those staying in school) to grade 5 of primary education.

208. However, data on the survival rates are limited. Only 40 developing countries have sufficient data, and therefore estimates cannot be reliably made to assess progress at the global or regional levels. Among the 40 countries, 25 have shown at least a slight improvement during the past 10 years, with 13 countries showing an improvement of 10 per cent or more. Survival rates have either stagnated or deteriorated among the 15 remaining countries, with 8 — all in sub-Saharan Africa — experiencing a decrease of 10 per cent or more. Some of the 8 countries had relatively high survival rates to grade 5 at the beginning of the 1990s, but most of them have either had internal conflicts or been subject to the HIV/AIDS pandemic.

209. The final indicator is the literacy rate of youth aged 15 to 24 years. That measure of youth literacy reflects the accumulated achievement of primary education in teaching basic literacy skills, thereby enabling young people to apply reading and writing (and sometimes basic arithmetic and life skills) to daily life and to continue to learn and communicate using the written word. From 1990 to 2000, the world literacy rate in the age group 15-24 years increased slightly from 84.2 to 86.9 per cent, with the rate holding steady in the developed regions at 99.7 per cent, and increasing in developing regions from 81.1 to 84.4 per cent. In every region of the world the rate increased, although slightly in some regions, including Latin America and the Caribbean and most of Asia. The largest increases came in those regions with the lowest 1990 rates: Northern Africa rose from 66.3 to 76.1, sub-Saharan Africa from 66.5 to 76.4 and South-Central Asia from 63.0 to 70.8. The least developed countries rose from 54.4 to 63.6 per cent, which is still a low level, highlighting the work left to be done in this area.

210. It is clear that with regard to education, Africa, especially sub-Saharan Africa, lags behind other developing regions, although progress has been uneven across measurement indicators as well as across geographical regions. While the enrolment indicator is expected to meet the Millennium Development Goal target, except in Africa, actual completion of five years of primary education remains a challenge. Africa and other regions with low literacy rates, youth literacy in particular, are catching up, but much progress still needs to be made in those regions. That calls for continued active national and international policies to improve the performance of the educational systems, as reflected in such "output indicators" as completion rates and youth literacy. Finally, to address the challenges still facing Africa, a redoubling of efforts is necessary to overcome the region's unfavourable initial conditions in terms of human capital.

2. Health

211. The inequities and inequalities of being born in a disadvantaged place or situation rather than a more advantaged one are particularly striking — as well as disturbing — in the area of health. For example, there is a hundred-fold difference between the world's poorest and richest countries in the lifetime risk of dying in pregnancy.[102] More than 98 per cent of all deaths of children under 5 years of age, approximately 10.5 million in 2002, occur in developing countries, almost half of them in Africa.[103] Furthermore, only 5 per cent of those in the developing world who require antiretrovirals for treatment against HIV/AIDS are getting them, leading the World Health Organization to declare the situation a global health emergency.[104]

212. However, there have been some improvements in health in many developing countries over the past several years, and health-related inequalities are no longer necessarily between the developed and developing countries. For example, with respect to life expectancy, which is widely accepted as an indicator of the overall health situation, significant gains have been made in the past 50 years, and average life expectancy at birth has increased globally by almost 20 years, from 46.5 years in the period 1950 to 1955 to 65.2 years in 2002.[105] The previous large gap between developed and developing countries decreased considerably, with life expectancy increasing over the 50-year period by 26 years in the low-mortality developing countries, which have low child and adult mortality levels and have almost caught up with the developed countries, and by 17 years in the high-mortality developing countries. The latter countries, including most African countries and the poorer countries in Asia, the Eastern Mediterranean region and Latin America, continue to have both high child and high adult mortality levels. The gap that now exists is between the high-mortality developing countries and the others, namely the developed and low-mortality developing countries. In a similar way, the disparity between the different developing regions with respect to under-five child mortality rates is also widening because the rates among the better-off countries in developing regions are improving quickly, while many of the poorer countries have stagnated or even lost ground.[106]

213. Commitment 6 of the Copenhagen Declaration included, inter alia, achieving access for all to primary health care in order to promote and achieve the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health and to rectify inequalities relating to social conditions. The themes of universal access, pro-poor health systems, appropriate and effective expenditures of resources for primary health care and for improving health-care system performance, particularly at the primary care level, and of addressing the HIV/AIDS pandemic and other infectious and parasitic diseases were further emphasized at the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly.

214. The spirit of Commitment 6 on universal access to primary health care and combating devastating diseases, adopted at the Summit, was included in the Millennium Development Goals, which promoted several health objectives and implicitly addressed universal access to primary health care via explicit health-related goals and targets, including the following: reducing child mortality by two thirds between 1990 and 2015; improving maternal health by reducing the maternal mortality ratio by three fourths between 1990 and 2015; combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases by halting their advance and beginning to reverse their

spread by 2015; and, through a global partnership for development and in cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, providing access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries. The Millennium Development Goals also addressed other aspects of health via the targets of reducing hunger, decreasing the proportion of people without sustainable access to drinking water and achieving significant improvement in the lives of slum-dwellers.

215. While there are several imperatives for universal access to primary health care, a very important one is to reduce child and maternal mortality. Since both can be lowered with basic and relatively inexpensive primary care, child mortality rates and maternal mortality ratios serve as indicators of how universal the access to primary health care really is. They also give prominence and practical meaning, by measuring its impact, to the promotion of universal access.

216. According to the World Health Organization, of all the health-related Millennium Development Goal targets reducing child mortality rates by two thirds is the farthest from being realized.[107] Slight progress was made in reducing child mortality rates on a global level during the period 1990 to 2001, with developing countries as a whole experiencing a reduction of only 12 per cent over the 11 years, from 102 deaths per 1,000 live births to 90. On a regional basis, progress has been uneven. Most disturbing is that sub-Saharan Africa, the region with the highest level of child mortality, experienced only a 2 per cent reduction — the smallest percentage reduction in any region — from 186 deaths per 1,000 live births in 1990 to 174 in 2002.

217. The experience of sub-Saharan Africa is in sharp contrast to Northern Africa, which was able to reduce its rate by 51 per cent — the greatest percentage reduction in any region — from 88 deaths per 1,000 live births to 43, putting it on track to meet the two-thirds reduction target. Other regions experiencing significant declines from 1990 to 2002 were South-Eastern Asia, from 78 deaths per 1,000 live births to 48 (34 per cent); Latin America and the Caribbean, from 54 to 34 (33 per cent); and South-Central Asia, from 126 to 93 (24 per cent). Regions with more modest declines include Eastern Asia (18 per cent) and Western Asia and Oceania (11 per cent each). Within most regions, individual countries still remain that are not on track to meet the target.

218. The five diseases that account for over 50 per cent of deaths of children aged five or under are pneumonia, diarrhoea, malaria, measles and HIV infection. Malnutrition is also a contributing factor in over 60 per cent of the cases. More than one in five deaths among children occur during the first week of life, mostly due to malnutrition of the mother and foetus leading to low weights at birth and compounded by poor antenatal care facilities and a lack of skilled birth attendants. Children that survive the first week but then later fall ill and die often suffer not just from one disease but from several at the same time. For example, children suffering from measles are particularly susceptible to pneumonia, and inadequate access to food can increase the risk of respiratory and diarrhoeal infections, which in turn can lead to an increase in malnutrition.

219. Confirming the slight progress made in this area, of the 10.5 million deaths of children under 5 years of age who died in 2002, most could have been easily prevented with modest resources and tested policy interventions. According to the World Health Organization, while a lack of progress can be attributed to mother-to-child HIV transmission in some parts of Africa, for most countries the problem is

long-standing underinvestment in the necessary health care.[108] That observation applies to efforts both to reduce malnutrition and to achieve full coverage of interventions to reduce mortality. Such relatively inexpensive remedies as immunization against measles; protected drinking water, basic hygiene in the home and cheap oral rehydration to prevent and treat diarrhoea; antibiotics for respiratory infections, another big killer; and breastfeeding of all babies could prevent millions of deaths of children under 5 years of age per year.

220. Similarly disquieting is the fact that for more than 30 million women each year, pregnancy and childbirth mean unnecessary suffering, ill-health or death. Approximately half a million women die from preventable deaths in pregnancy and childbirth, and millions more suffer disabilities. Each year, millions of children are left motherless and, in relation to the preceding remarks on child mortality rates, an estimated 1 million children die as a result of the death of their mother. The risk of death for children under 5 years of age is doubled if their mother dies in childbirth.

221. Of all health statistics, maternal mortality rates show some of the greatest disparities between developed and developing countries. Ninety-nine per cent of maternal deaths occur in developing countries, and in poor countries as many as 30 per cent of deaths among women of reproductive age (15-49 years) may be due to pregnancy-related causes, as compared with rates of less than 1 per cent in developed countries. In 2000, the maternal mortality ratio, measured as maternal deaths per 100,000 live births, showed 400 maternal deaths per 100,000 live births in developing regions, 19 times greater than in developed regions. The lifetime risk of maternal death was 1 in 61 in developing countries, 45 times greater than the risk of 1 in 2,800 in developed countries. At the regional extremes, the lifetime risk was 1 in 16 in sub-Saharan Africa, 249 times greater than the risk of 1 in 4,000 in Western Europe.

222. The observed trends in HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases indicate another area that demands urgent attention. The HIV/AIDS pandemic is by far the leading cause of premature mortality in sub-Saharan Africa, and it is the fourth-biggest killer worldwide. In 2003, 40 million people were living with HIV/AIDS, 3 million people died from the disease and an estimated 5 million people became newly infected. In sub-Saharan Africa, there were an estimated 2.4 million deaths from AIDS in 2003, and the proportion of adults aged 15-49 living with HIV/AIDS reached 8.5 per cent, but with rates of over 30 per cent in some countries. The Caribbean is the second most affected region, with a prevalence rate of 2.5 per cent. Several countries in Eastern Europe are experiencing epidemics that are among the fastest growing in the world. The HIV/AIDS prevalence in the countries of Asia and Oceania, although relatively low, nonetheless amounts to an estimated 7.4 million people.

223. The pandemic has important gender dimensions. In 2002, the number of adult women living with HIV/AIDS worldwide surpassed the number of adult men. In sub-Saharan Africa, women are 1.2 times more likely to be infected than men. The disease has other impacts: women and girls also bear the brunt of caring for sick relatives, and women may not have the money or the independence within the household to pay for and take drugs to prevent mother-to-child transmission.

224. Malaria and tuberculosis are also taking a devastating toll. At a minimum, 1 million people die from malaria every year, and malaria is likely to be a contributing factor in another 2 million deaths. About 90 per cent of global malaria

deaths occur in sub-Saharan Africa, and 90 per cent of all malaria deaths in sub-Saharan Africa occur in young children. Currently, 40 per cent of the world's population, primarily in the world's poorest countries, is at risk of contracting malaria.

225. Tuberculosis results in 1.6 million deaths every year. In addition, almost half a million people infected with HIV also contract tuberculosis as a result. Each year there are about 8 million new tuberculosis cases. Most of the deaths associated with tuberculosis occur during an adult's most productive years, between the ages of 15 and 54. The worst-hit region is South-Eastern Asia, with 3 million new cases per year. In Eastern Europe, tuberculosis deaths are increasing after almost 40 years of decline. Although worldwide data do not provide comprehensive information on trends, it seems that tuberculosis is on the rise in many developing countries owing to economic decline, HIV/AIDS, multi-drug resistant tuberculosis and the erosion of health systems.

226. Health issues have received increasing attention in the 10 years since the Summit, as attested, among many other initiatives, by their inclusion in the Millennium Development Goals. However, even though the actual trends do indicate important overall progress in the reduction of child mortality, in the improvement of maternal health and in the battle against HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases, much still needs to be accomplished, particularly in guaranteeing the financial resources to achieve Commitment 6 on universal access to primary health care and combating devastating diseases. The mixed results are notably in evidence in Africa and in the least developed countries in general, where significant gaps in the health situation still prevail between the least developed countries and the rich countries and between the rich and poor people within the very poor countries.

F. Conclusion

227. As previously indicated, there have been both advances and severe disappointments in the social situation with respect to the Summit's priority areas of poverty, employment, social integration, gender equality and universal access to education and primary health care. On an aggregate, worldwide basis, there has been some progress, as measured by specific statistical indicators, in a number of — but not all — areas of social development. The proportion of people living in extreme poverty worldwide has declined. The number of women elected to representative office has increased, educational enrolment rates are moving in the direction of equalization at the primary and secondary levels and the global literacy rate for women is increasing.

228. Even in areas where global indicators have improved, the progress made and the pace of change often varies widely between regions and even more so between countries within regions. Those differences can be illustrated in the area of health. While world life expectancy has increased, it has actually declined in sub-Saharan Africa, where the HIV/AIDS pandemic, with its devastating effects on all aspects of social development, is wreaking havoc on the region. Nevertheless, some countries in sub-Saharan Africa have turned the corner in the struggle, illustrating that there are country differences and that government policy can make a difference against the disease.

229. There are also areas where progress has been either marginal or non-existent in the last 10 years. The world unemployment rate has increased since the Summit, and the goals of full employment and social integration have not been fully incorporated into the general development discourse outside of social development circles. The inequalities that come from being born a woman or being born at the "wrong place at the wrong time" continue to exist. Other inequalities and inequities, such as unequal access to social services or the uneven application of legal rights and privileges, continue to be obstacles to people living a decent and fulfilling life. And the rising levels of income inequality, intra- and inter-country, is still a cause for concern with respect to the possibilities for lifting people out of poverty and fostering social integration and cohesion.

V. The way forward: implementing people-centred development

230. The comprehensive and demanding vision of social development agreed upon at the World Summit for Social Development in Copenhagen and reaffirmed at the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly in Geneva has yet to receive the attention it deserves. The enabling environment envisaged by the Copenhagen Declaration[1] was conceived so as to create the conditions for people to achieve social development. The economic, political, social, legal and cultural dimensions embedded in it are especially important. The commitments on eradicating poverty, promotion of full employment and social integration were accompanied by far-reaching policy recommendations based on the conviction that the well-being of people should be the centrepiece of national and international public attention. The people-centred approach to policy-making has not lost its relevance and appeal, but it is neglected in many quarters, and it is also threatened by recent developments on the international scene. Its implementation ought to dominate and shape the agendas of national Governments and international organizations in order to restore the spirit of the Summit and to foster the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals.

231. **The Commission for Social Development, on the basis of its review of further implementation of the World Summit for Social Development and the outcome of the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly, may wish to reaffirm the need for a people-centred approach to development and for its urgent and concrete implementation through coordinated and coherent efforts by the international community.**

232. **The Commission may wish to stress that people-centred development has a number of requirements, including the following: a revisiting of the perennial and still elusive question of a proper integration of economic and social policies, notably through the relationships between macroeconomic policies and social development goals; better understanding and better management of the social dimensions and consequences of the interdependence of nations in an increasingly globalized world; and a renewed conception of the relations between the public and the private spheres and of the role of States, notably in the formulation and implementation of social policies.**

233. **The Commission may also wish to recommend to the General Assembly through the Economic and Social Council that due consideration be given to a people-centred approach and its requirements when it undertakes its special**

event in 2005 in the context of the five-year review of the United Nations Millennium Declaration, including, specifically, the steps outlined below.

1. Strengthening the prospects of an enabling environment for people-centred development

234. The imbalance between the pace of globalization and the regulatory framework prevailing today has resulted in many asymmetries that need to be corrected. At the political and institutional level, emphasis should be placed on the equitable distribution of the benefits in an increasingly open world economy, with actions that promote democratic participation by all countries and peoples in the decision-making processes that govern international relations. Implementing people-centred development calls for an approach that places the highest priority on the long-term objectives of social development. Those overarching policy goals require the following:

- That actions are taken by the international community to lend political and institutional support to national capacity-building in the developing world, particularly to restoring the regulatory capacity of public institutions and especially in areas where privatization of the delivery of social services has created new challenges to and difficulties in the actual exercise of individual and collective rights to education, health and other so-called social rights of citizenship.
- That a necessary balance is established between market forces and the public interest, especially through appropriate State regulation and oversight of corporate power and market forces.
- That flexibility is introduced into macroeconomic policies in order for national policies to counter the negative impacts of globalization on social development. Such an undertaking entails the promotion of counter-cyclical monetary and fiscal policies to expand employment and reduce poverty as well as shift the focus away from short-term economic efficiency towards long-term development objectives. This step is particularly important in view of the constraints arising from competitive pressures brought about by international trade. Specific measures should also be introduced in foreign direct investment to promote domestic productive linkages and job creation.
- That a global minimum standard is established for social protection in order to stabilize incomes, distribute the gains of globalization for the benefit of all and support the development of new capabilities. The international standard, built on and harmonizing all the initiatives analysed in the present report, would prevent the "race to the bottom" in which countries are forced to overlook or limit social rules and regulations in order to remain competitive in the international market.
- That proposals for the reform of global financial architecture translate into action, particularly by enhancing the capacity, in some developing countries, of the offices of the executive directors of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund; by increasing surveillance and regulation of international capital flows providing adequate room to manoeuvre for counter-cyclical macroeconomic policies of developing countries; and by strengthening regional cooperation efforts.

- That the various international social and economic regimes are reoriented towards a more coherent and integrated approach. Of special importance is the harmonization of such World Trade Organization decisions and regulations as the General Agreement on Trade in Services and the Trade-related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights with other multilateral agreements in the social arena.
- That innovative ideas guaranteeing sufficient and stable financing to achieve major international objectives are introduced to generate new sources of finance for development. The General Assembly and the Bretton Woods institutions should, in that regard, take the political decisions to advance some of the proposals that are under consideration.

235. Actions to strengthen the enabling environment must necessarily be accompanied by specific measures relating to the three core issues of the Summit, which remain fundamental for the promotion of social development. Consequently, for the attainment of the commitments made at the Summit in the core areas, implementing people-centred development requires the actions identified below.

2. Intensifying integrated strategies and policies for poverty eradication

236. A key foundation for policy decisions that aim at poverty reduction and eradication is to attack those situations directly rather than to assume the potential benefits of a trickle-down outcome of other policies intended to promote economic growth and development. Towards that end, specific policies and actions must be implemented to guarantee that the dimensions of equity and equality are explicitly incorporated in policies and programmes designed to achieve poverty reduction, and that policies and programmes for poverty eradication include specific measures to guarantee access by marginalized socio-economic sectors to assets and opportunities in general, and in particular to education, land, capital and technology.

3. Guaranteeing the existence of employment opportunities for all

237. An employment strategy that aims to promote decent work under conditions of equity, security and dignity should be a fundamental component of any development strategy. It must be oriented to the incorporation of employment creation into macroeconomic policy. Such a strategy also requires undertaking employment impact analysis as a basic criterion for macroeconomic policy and for policy decisions adopted in other areas. Furthermore, it calls for adopting specific measures to incorporate the informal sector in social protection programmes and for establishing incentive structures that promote employment creation by directing investment to sectors that are productive and labour-intensive, with a special view to promoting small and medium-sized enterprises.

4. Fostering social integration and cohesion

238. Policy makers are asked to take into consideration the importance of explicit policies to counter both the negative effects of globalization on social development and the new threats posed by market-driven reforms, as there are signs that those activities are producing and reinforcing new patterns of social exclusion. Thus, deliberate action must be taken to guarantee that cultural, religious and ethnic identities and rights are explicitly protected in international agreements and in national and local laws, and to enforce them as a code of conduct for national and

transnational corporations and private interests operating under national jurisdictions. Similarly, there is an urgent need to design and implement programmes to enlarge opportunities for participation in decision-making processes, including the identification of specific areas of public policy formulation that must incorporate participatory mechanisms, by legally ensuring unrestricted access of information to citizens in general and by establishing mechanisms for greater open review of government policies.

5. Focus on Africa

239. The review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit for Social Development and the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly reveals that, 10 years after the Summit, the gap between Africa and the rest of the world remains, and that it has even widened in some aspects. The marginalization of Africa in a globalizing world and the human suffering associated with a lack of development in the region are unacceptable.

240. Foremost among the key areas of international action is the commitment that technical and financial assistance will be earmarked in explicit quantitative targets to guarantee, within the framework of the New Partnership for Africa's Development, a favourable environment for social and economic development in Africa. That objective will be achieved by the following actions:

- Finding a solution to the external debt situation, building upon the HIPC Initiative
- Facilitating capacity-building to promote export diversification and remove constraints to market access in order to benefit from preferential treatment in international trade
- Supporting human capital formation
- Halting the spread of HIV/AIDS and malaria.

241. Overall, for Africa as well as for the other parts of an increasingly interdependent and yet fragmented world, progress towards the realization of people-centred development requires a conceptual and political shift of great magnitude. Issues of equity, equality and solidarity in the economic, social, cultural and political realms, and within and among nations and regions, will have to gain a central position in international development cooperation.

Notes

[1] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I.

[2] Ibid., annex II.

[3] See A/56/326 and A/59/282 and Corr.1.

[4] See *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 25.

[5] Ibid., see para. 7.

[6] Ibid., see para. 27 (a).

[7] Ibid., see chap. IV, para. 70.

[8] Ibid., see chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 8.

[9] General Assembly resolution 55/2.

[10] See *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 36.

[11] Ibid., see para. 19. Poverty is defined as a "lack of income and productive resources sufficient to ensure sustainable livelihoods; hunger and malnutrition; ill health; limited or lack of access to education and other basic services; increased morbidity and mortality from illness; homelessness and inadequate housing; unsafe environments; and social discrimination and exclusion. It is also characterized by a lack of participation in decision-making and in civil, social and cultural life."

[12] Ibid., see para. 42.

[13] World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization, *A Fair Globalization: Creating Opportunities for All* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[14] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 29.

[15] The information on democracy in this section is based on United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2002: Deepening Democracy in a Fragmenting World* (New York, Oxford University Press, 2002), chap. 1. The comparison was based on the 147 countries for which data was available.

[16] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 4.

[17] World Bank, *World Development Report 2000/2001. Attacking Poverty* (New York, Oxford University Press, 2000), chap. 6.

[18] World Bank, "Comprehensive Development Framework: meeting the promise? Early experience and emerging issues" (Washington, D.C., CDF Secretariat, 2001).

[19] International Labour Organization, *World Labour Report, 1997-1998: Industrial Relations, Democracy and Social Stability* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 1998), table 1.2.

[20] See, for instance, *World Development Report, 1997: The State in a Changing World* (Washington, D.C., World Bank, and New York, Oxford University Press, 1997).

[21] See *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 95 (f).

[22] Ibid., para. 96 (a).

[23] Economic and Social Council resolution 40/1, annex, para. 2.

[24] See, for example, World Bank, "Social Development in World Bank operations: results and way forward", discussion draft (Washington, D.C., 12 February 2004).

[25] World Bank, "Board presentations of PRSP documents", accessed 23 August 2004. Updates available from http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPRS1/Resources/boardlist.pdf.

[26] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 91.

[27] International Monetary Fund and International Development Association, "Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative: status of implementation" (Washington, D.C., 12 September 2003).

[28] "Review of Nordic monitoring of the World Bank and the IMF support to the PRSP process" (Brussels, 2003).

[29] World Bank, "Social development in World Bank operations: results and way forward" (Washington, D.C., 2004), p. 17.

[30] For additional information, see United Nations, Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, *Globalization and Development* (E/LC/G.2157(SES.29/3)) (2002).

[31] See, for example, Andrea Cornia and Julius Court, *Inequality, Growth and Poverty in an Era of Liberalization and Globalization*, Policy Brief No. 4 (Helsinki, United Nations University, World Institute for Development Economics Research (UNU/WIDER), 2001).

[32] Alemayehu Geda, "Openness, inequality and poverty in Africa: exploring the role of global interdependence", background paper prepared for the fourth meeting of the International Forum for Social Development: Equity, Inequalities and Interdependence, New York, 5-6 October 2004.

[33] United Nations, Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, *A Decade of Social Development in Latin America, 1990-1999* (LC/G.2212-P/1) (2004).

[34] Parthapratim Pal, Ranja Sengupta and Jayati Ghosh, "Inequality in China and South Asia: a survey of recent trends"; and Kwame Sundaram Jomo, "Growth with equity in East Asia?", papers prepared for the fourth meeting of the International Forum for Social Development: Equity, Inequalities and Interdependence, New York, 5-6 October 2004.

[35] For example, the ISO 14000 series of the International Organization for Standardization (1996); the Global Reporting Initiative launched in 1999 by the United Nations Environment Programme; the CERES Coalition of over seventy major companies in the United States of America; the Standards of Corporate Social Responsibility set forth in 1999 by the business-led coalition, Social Venture Network; and the more recent Global Compact unveiled by the Secretary-General in 2000 and supported so far by over 300 companies.

[36] Available from http://www.equator-principles.com/documents/Equator_Principles.pdf.

[37] See Dealogic, *ProjectWare*, http://www.dealogic.com, accessed 4 June 2004. Links: Analytics and Market Data/ProjectWare.

[38] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 14.

[39] See Plan of Action, United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, Tenth Session, Bangkok, 12-19 February 2000 (TD/386), para. 4.

[40] Ibid., para. 9.

[41] United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, eleventh session, "The Spirit of Sao Paulo", Sao Paulo, Brazil, 13-18 June 2004 (TD/L.382), declaration by the member States.

[42] World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization, *A Fair Globalization: Creating Opportunities for All* (International Labour Office, Geneva, 2004).

[43] Ibid., para. 12.

[44] In Isabelle Grumberg and Sarbuland Khan, editors, *Globalization: The United Nations Development Dialogue: Finance, Trade, Poverty, Peace-Building* (New York, United Nations University Press, 2000).

[45] Ibid.

[46] See *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 29.

[47] *Report of the International Conference on Financing for Development, Monterrey, Mexico, 18-22 March 2002* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.02.II.A.7), chap. I, resolution 1, annex.

[48] See Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, Development Assistance Committee, *International Development Statistics Online*, table 1, "Disbursements and commitments of official and private flows".

[49] See Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, *2003 Development Cooperation Report* (Paris, 2003), Statistical annex.

---

[50] **Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, "OECD report shows rising aid flows but more effort needed to reach Monterrey goals", press release of 29 January 2004, available from http://www.oecd.org/document/19/0,2340,en_2649_34487_25612371_1_1_1_1,00.html. Accessed 20 April 2004.**

[51] ***World Economic and Social Survey, 2004: Trends and Policies in the World Economy* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.04.II.C.1).**

[52] **Ibid.**

[53] **Measured in constant 2000 dollars and market exchange rates.**

[54] **Data on world and regional military expenditure estimates are from Stockholm International Peace Research Institute, *SIPRI Yearbook 2003: Armaments, Disarmament and International Security* (New York, Oxford University Press, 2003), table 10.1, and from the report of the Group of Governmental Experts on the relationship between disarmament and development (A/59/119), para. 24.**

[55] **A/59/119, para. 27.**

[56] **United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2003: Millennium Development Goals: A Compact among Nations to End Human Poverty* (New York, Oxford University Press, 2003).**

[57] **A. B. Atkinson, editor, *New Sources of Development Finance*, UNU-WIDER Studies in Development Economics (New York, Oxford University Press, 2004).**

[58] **There are significant overlaps between the two groups since the majority of least developed countries are African countries.**

[59] **Based on data provided by the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development Development Assistance Committee.**

[60] **United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, *The Least Developed Countries Report 2004: Linking International Trade with Poverty Reduction* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.04.II.D.27), and World Bank, *World Development Indicators 2004* (Washington, D.C., 2004), table 1.[illegible]**

[61] **International Monetary Fund and International Development Association, "Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative: status of implementation" (Washington, D.C., 20 August 2004).**

[62] **World Bank and International Monetary Fund, "Heavily Indebted Poor Countries (HIPC) Initiative: status of implementation" (Washington, D.C., 23 September 2004).**

[63] **A/57/763, enclosure.**

[64] **United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, *Trade Preferences for LDCs: An Early Assessment of Benefits and Possible Improvements* (UNCTAD/ITCD/TSB/2003/8).**

[65] **A/59/119, para. 24.**

[66] **Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, *Report of the World Food Summit, 13-17 November 1996* (WFS 96/REP), part one, appendix.**

[67] **Ibid.**

[68] **See *Report of the International Conference on Financing for Development, Monterrey, Mexico, 18-22 March 2002* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.02.II.A.7), chap. I, resolution 1, annex, para. 19.**

[69] **See United Nations Statistics Division, "Progress towards the Millennium Development Goals, 1990-2003", working paper, http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mi/mi_coverfinal.htm (accessed 10 August 2004); and, for 2001 data, see World Bank, World Development Indicators (Washington, D.C., 2004).**

[70] United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Report 2003: Millennium Development Goals: A Compact among Nations to End Human Poverty* (New York, Oxford University Press, 2003).

[71] See United Nations Statistics Division, "Progress towards the Millennium Development Goals, 1990-2003: goal 1: eradicate extreme poverty and hunger", http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mi/mi_coverfinal.htm (accessed 10 August 2004).

[72] Ibid.

[73] World Bank, "Partnerships in development: progress in the fight against poverty" (Washington, D.C., 2004).

[74] Millennium Project, "Interim report of Task Force 1 on Poverty and Economic Development", 10 February 2004.

[75] United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, *Least Developed Countries Report 2004: Linking International Trade with Poverty Reduction* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.04.II.D.27).

[76] Ibid.

[77] Of the 66 least developed countries, 51 succeeded in increasing exports over the five-year period. Analysing further the average private consumption per capita of the 51 countries, UNCTAD found that 22 (fewer than half) had a virtuous trade effect, meaning that average private per capita consumption increased with export expansion during the five-year period examined, 11 had an ambiguous trade effect and 18 had an immiserizing trade effect, meaning that average private per capita consumption decreased with export expansion. See United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, *Least Developed Countries Report 2004: Linking International Trade with Poverty Reduction* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.04.II.D.27).

[78] Brian R. Copeland and M. Scott Taylor, "Trade liberalization and poverty: the evidence so far", *Journal of Economic Literature*, vol. XLII, No. 1 (March 2004).

[79] Employment statistics based on International Labour Organization, *Global Employment Trends 2004* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[80] Marlyn Carr and Martha A. Chen, "Globalization and the informal economy: how global trade and investment impact on the working poor" (Cambridge, Massachusetts, Women in Informal Employment Globalizing and Organizing, 2001).

[81] *World Youth Report 2003* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.03.IV.7).

[82] International Labour Organization, *Global Employment Trends 2004* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[83] International Labour Organization, *Global Employment Trends for Youth* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[84] International Labour Organization, *Global Employment Trends for Women 2004* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[85] World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization, *A Fair Globalization: Creating Opportunities for All* (Geneva, International Labour Office, 2004).

[86] World Summit on the Information Society, available from http://www.itu.int/wsis/ (accessed 8 June 2004).

[87] See International Labour Conference, ninety-second session, 2004, "Towards a fair deal for migrant workers in the global economy", www.ilo.org/public/english/bureau/inf/pr/2004/19.htm.

[88] Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, *OECD Employment Outlook: Towards More and Better Jobs* (Paris, 2003).

[89] International Labour Organization, press release, 27 April 2004 (ILO/04/16).

[90] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 68.

[91] *Report of the Second World Assembly on Ageing, Madrid, 8-12 April 2002* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.02.IV.4), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II.

[92] See A/50/114, para. 38.

[93] *Report of the Second World Assembly on Ageing, Madrid, 8-12 April 2002* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.02.IV.4), chap. I, resolution 1, annex II, para. 17.

[94] United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, *The Least Developed Countries Report 2002: Escaping the Poverty Trap* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.02.II.D.13).

[95] World Bank, *World Development Report 2004: Making Services Work for Poor People* (Washington, D.C., World Bank; and New York, Oxford University Press, 2003).

[96] *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annex I, para. 7.

[97] Resolution 34/180, annex; also available from *United Nations Treaty Collection Database*, http://untreaty.un.org/english/access.asp (accessed August 2004).

[98] United Nations, WomenWatch, *Follow-up to Beijing: National Level*, available from http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/country/national/natplans.htm (accessed 20 August 2004).

[99] The findings on gender equality are based on data contained in United Nations Statistics Division, "Progress towards the Millennium Development Goals, 1990-2003", available from http://millenniumindicators.un.org/unsd/mi/pdf/Goal_3-final.pdf.

[100] United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, *Final Report of the World Education Forum, Dakar, Senegal, 26-28 April 2000* (Paris, 2000).

[101] Available from http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mi/MDG-Page2.pdf (accessed 23 April 2004).

[102] World Health Organization, *The World Health Report 2003 — Shaping the Future*, Geneva, p. 29.

[103] Ibid., pp. xii and 7.

[104] Ibid., p. vii.

[105] Ibid., p. 3.

[106] Ibid., p. 7.

[107] Ibid., p. 27.

[108] Ibid.

Annex

A. International agenda on social development leading to the World Summit for Social Development

The foundation for the concept of social development embodied in the World Summit for Social Development was laid at the inception of the United Nations. Although the term "social development" does not exist per se in the Charter of the United Nations, the Preamble does proclaim a determination "to promote social progress and better standards of life in larger freedom" and to that end to draw upon international machinery to promote economic and social advancement for all people. Furthermore, Article 55 (a) of Chapter IX of the Charter, which deals with international economic and social cooperation, states that, in order to create conditions of stability and well-being, "the United Nations shall promote higher standards of living, full employment, and conditions of economic and social progress and development".

Three years after the Charter, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948) reiterated the importance of social development by setting forth the economic, social and cultural rights of everyone and by affirming their equal and interdependent relationship with civil and political rights. That was translated into a legal obligation by the adoption of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. Therefore, social development became associated with the development of a set of rights, among them the right to work in just and favourable conditions; the right to form trade unions; the right to attain social security and an adequate standard of living, including food, clothing and housing; the right to pursue enjoyment of physical and mental health; and the right to acquire an education and take part in cultural life.

The concept of social development and, notably, that of the responsibility of public authorities and agencies for its promotion and implementation were further elaborated in the Declaration on Social Progress and Development,[a] which itself builds on the elements of Chapter IX of the Charter. The Declaration was passed in the late 1960s, at a time when the membership of the United Nations was expanding, generating increased attention to development issues in general and to social development in particular. During the same time period, the Social Commission (created in 1946) enlarged its membership and agenda and changed its name to the Commission for Social Development, helping to set the stage for the passage of the Declaration in 1969.

The Declaration asserted that "social development can be promoted by peaceful coexistence, friendly relations and cooperation among States with different social, economic or political systems". It also emphasized "the interdependence of economic and social development in the wider process of growth and change, as well as the importance of a strategy of integrated development which takes full account at all stages of its social aspects" — a fundamental theme of social development that continues to reverberate throughout the United Nations today.

The call for a summit on social development emerged following a statement by the President of Chile to the General Assembly in 1990, in which he stated that without social justice, economic development and political stability would be endangered. In the following year, the Government of Chile proposed the convening of a summit to place the human being and its social needs at the heart of United Nations endeavours.[b] In December 1992, the General Assembly, in its resolution 47/92, officially decided to convene the Summit at the level of Heads of State or Government and accepted the offer of the Government of Denmark to act as host in its capital city of Copenhagen.

During the two years of international dialogue that preceded the Summit, representatives of Member States focused on three problems common to every country regardless of its stage of development, namely poverty, unemployment and lack of social integration. The Commission for Social Development, in the report of its thirty-third session, helped to clarify the agenda of the Summit, including the treatment of the three core issues. It was acknowledged that the ultimate goal of development was to enhance the quality of life of all peoples. Member States agreed that, in order to reduce and eliminate major sources of distress and instability for individuals, families and society, it was necessary to address the underlying obstacles to achieving social development.

The conditions that prevailed at the time of the convening of the Summit, however, were not necessarily conducive to global action on social development. There was, in the mid-1990s, a growing adherence to neoliberal ideas, particularly those that focused on economic growth and stabilization, which were further reinforced by the unprecedented high economic growth in Asian economies and signs of recovery in Africa and Latin America.[c] Those conditions made it difficult for more inclusive development models to emerge, as social development was often treated as subordinate to economic issues. Nonetheless, the Summit brought together 117 Heads of State or Government, who committed themselves to creating an economic, political, social, cultural and legal environment that would enable people to achieve social development.

B. The ten commitments of the 1995 Summit in Copenhagen

At the Summit, Governments adopted the Copenhagen Declaration on Social Development and Programme of Action of the World Summit for Social Development, and identified the eradication of poverty, the promotion of full employment and the fostering of social integration as goals of the highest priority for achieving secure, stable and just societies. At the heart of the Copenhagen Declaration are the ten commitments to social development agreed to by the Heads of State and Government at the Summit, which embody the global drive for social progress and development. The commitments are given below.[d]

Commitment 1
An enabling environment for social development

> "We commit ourselves to creating an economic, political, social, cultural and legal environment that will enable people to achieve social development."

Commitment 2
Poverty eradication

> "We commit ourselves to the goal of eradicating poverty in the world, through decisive national actions and international cooperation, as an ethical, social, political and economic imperative of humankind."

Commitment 3
Full employment

> "We commit ourselves to promoting the goal of full employment as a basic priority of our economic and social policies, and to enabling all men and women to attain secure and sustainable livelihoods through freely chosen productive employment and work."

Commitment 4
Social integration

> "We commit ourselves to promoting social integration by fostering societies that are stable, safe and just and that are based on the promotion and protection of all human rights, as well as on non-discrimination, tolerance, respect for diversity, equality of opportunity, solidarity, security, and participation of all people, including disadvantaged and vulnerable groups and persons."

Commitment 5
Achieve equality and equity between women and men

> "We commit ourselves to promoting full respect for human dignity and to achieving equality and equity between women and men, and to recognizing and enhancing the participation and leadership roles of women in political, civil, economic, social and cultural life and in development."

Commitment 6
Universal and equitable access to quality education and primary health care

> "We commit ourselves to promoting and attaining the goals of universal and equitable access to quality education, the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health, and the access of all to primary health care, making particular efforts to rectify inequalities relating to social conditions and without distinction as to race, national origin, gender, age or disability; respecting and promoting our common and particular cultures; striving to strengthen the role of culture in development; preserving the essential bases of people-centred sustainable development; and contributing to the full development of human resources and to social development. The purpose of these activities is to eradicate poverty, promote full and productive employment and foster social integration."

Commitment 7
Accelerate development in Africa

> "We commit ourselves to accelerating the economic, social and human resource development of Africa and the least developed countries."

Commitment 8
Ensure that structural adjustment programmes include social development goals

> "We commit ourselves to ensuring that when structural adjustment programmes are agreed to they include social development goals, in particular eradicating poverty, promoting full and productive employment, and enhancing social integration."

Commitment 9
Increase significantly and/or utilize more efficiently the resources allocated to social development

> "We commit ourselves to increasing significantly and/or utilizing more efficiently the resources allocated to social development in order to achieve the goals of the Summit through national action and regional and international cooperation."

Commitment 10
Promote an improved and strengthened framework for international, regional and subregional cooperation for social development

> "We commit ourselves to an improved and strengthened framework for international, regional and subregional cooperation for social development, in a spirit of partnership, through the United Nations and other multilateral institutions."

C. Five-year review: the twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly in 2000

The twenty-fourth special session of the General Assembly, held at Geneva from 26 to 30 June 2000, was convened to take stock of progress over the five-year period following the Summit and to formulate policy guidelines and new initiatives to further implement the outcomes of the Summit. Member States reaffirmed their commitment to the Copenhagen Declaration and Programme of Action, including their determination to eradicate poverty, promote full and productive employment and foster social integration, while at the same time adopting a number of new initiatives to further advance the social development agenda.

The special session called attention to the effects of globalization and rapid technological advances in social and economic growth and development, with particular emphasis drawn to their impact on developing countries. There was wide recognition of the need for collective action to anticipate and offset the negative social and economic consequences of globalization and to maximize its benefits for all members of society, including those with special needs. Furthermore, the special session underscored the importance of universal and equitable access to quality education and health care for all to foster and develop productive human potential. In recognition of new development initiatives, the special session acknowledged the important role of the New Partnership for Africa's Development and the poverty reduction strategy papers in achieving sustainable social and economic development and poverty eradication.[e]

Against the background of a reduced capacity on the part of many Governments, especially those of developing countries, to raise resources for social development through taxation in the context of the mobility of capital, a number of initiatives to mobilize resources for social development at both the national and the international level were agreed upon, including further studies on proposals for international taxation and supporting Governments in establishing guidelines for generating domestic revenue for social services, social protection and social programmes.

With the Asian financial crisis still fresh in the background, the outcome document advocated a number of measures to enhance financial stability and reduce the negative impacts of international financial turbulence on social and economic development. Measures to achieve that goal, inter alia, included improving the transparency of financial flows; developing, strengthening and enforcing regulatory frameworks for monitoring operations; reducing the volatility of short-term capital flows through improved preventive and early-warning capabilities; and consideration of a temporary debt standstill.

Perhaps the most significant contribution made by the twenty-fourth special session was the introduction of the goal of halving the proportion of the people living in extreme poverty by 2015. That goal, explicitly stated for the first time in the history of the United Nations, continues to resonate strongly in the first Millennium Development Goal and as one of the internationally agreed development goals contained in the Millennium Declaration.

Finally, but no less importantly, the twenty-fourth special session placed a special emphasis on the need to reassess market-oriented macroeconomic policies with the goals of greater employment generation and a reduction in the poverty level. It therefore called for a coherent and coordinated international strategy on employment, supported the convening of a world employment forum by the International Labour Organization and reaffirmed its support for existing instruments and programmes on basic workers' rights and quality-of-work issues. That support included ratification and implementation of International Labour Organization conventions concerning basic workers' rights and the rights of minors, women, youth, persons with disabilities, migrants and indigenous people, of the International Labour Organization Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and its follow-up and of the International Labour Organization Convention concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (No. 182), as well as promotion of the International Labour Organization programme on decent work, of minimum wages and social protection and of health and safety issues relating to employment.

Notes

[a] Resolution 2542 (XXIV).

[b] Press release, Economic and Social Council, Second Committee, 1st meeting, 13 May 1991.

[c] United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, *Visible Hands: Taking Responsibility for Social Development* (Geneva, 2000).

[d] For a complete explanation, see *Report of the World Summit for Social Development, Copenhagen, 6-12 March 1995* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.96.IV.8), chap. I, resolution 1, annexes I and II.

[e] For a complete review of the twenty-fourth special session, see A/55/344 and *Official Records of the General Assembly, Twenty-fourth Special Session, Supplement No. 1* (A/S-24/10), resolution S-24/2, "Further initiatives for social development", annex.